

1005

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

RECEIVED

OCT 19 1992

National Register of Historic Places Registration Form

NATIONAL REGISTER

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations of eligibility for individual properties or districts. See instructions in Guidelines for Completing National Register Forms (National Register Bulletin 16). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the requested information. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, styles, materials, and areas of significance, enter only the categories and subcategories listed in the instructions. For additional space use continuation sheets (Form 10-900a). Type all entries.

1. Name of Property

historic name ALL SAINTS' EPISCOPAL CHURCH
other names/site number All Saints' Church

2. Location

street & number 516 North Central Avenue N/A not for publication
city, town Valley City N/A vicinity
state North Dakota code ND county Barnes code 003 zip code 58072

3. Classification

Ownership of Property	Category of Property	Number of Resources within Property	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> private	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> building(s)	Contributing	Noncontributing
<input type="checkbox"/> public-local	<input type="checkbox"/> district	<u>1</u>	_____ buildings
<input type="checkbox"/> public-state	<input type="checkbox"/> site	_____	_____ sites
<input type="checkbox"/> public-Federal	<input type="checkbox"/> structure	_____	_____ structures
	<input type="checkbox"/> object	_____	_____ objects
		<u>1</u>	_____ Total

Name of related multiple property listing:
Episcopal Churches of North Dakota

Number of contributing resources previously listed in the National Register N/A

4. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, I hereby certify that this nomination request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property meets does not meet the National Register criteria. See continuation sheet.

James E. [Signature] North Dakota SHPO 10-13-92
Signature of certifying official Date
State Historical Society of North Dakota

State or Federal agency and bureau

In my opinion, the property meets does not meet the National Register criteria. See continuation sheet.

Signature of commenting or other official

Date

State or Federal agency and bureau

5. National Park Service Certification

I, hereby, certify that this property is:

- entered in the National Register. See continuation sheet
- determined eligible for the National Register. See continuation sheet.
- determined not eligible for the National Register.
- removed from the National Register.
- other, (explain:)

[Signature] Entered in the National Register 12/3/92

Signature of the Keeper

Date of Action

6. Function or Use

Historic Functions (enter categories from instructions)

RELIGION/religious facility

Current Functions (enter categories from instructions)

RELIGION/religious facility

7. Description

Architectural Classification

(enter categories from instructions)

Gothic Revival

Materials (enter categories from instructions)

foundation brick

walls stone

roof wood/shingle

other brick

Describe present and historic physical appearance.

[X] See continuation sheet, section 7, page 1.

8. Statement of Significance

Certifying official has considered the significance of this property in relation to other properties:

nationally statewide locally

Applicable National Register Criteria A B C D

Criteria Considerations (Exceptions) A B C D E F G

Areas of Significance

(Enter categories from instructions)

Architecture

Exploration/settlement

Period of Significance

1881

1881-97

Significant Dates

1881

Cultural Affiliation

N/A

Significant Person

N/A

Architect/Builder

Unknown

State significance of property, and justify criteria, criteria considerations, and areas and periods of significance noted above.

[X] See continuation sheet, section 8, page 1.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 1

The first stone Episcopal church in North Dakota, All Saints' Episcopal Church in Valley City is largely unaltered and displays the key defining design elements of the property type, Episcopal Churches of North Dakota, 1872-1920s. These features are the presence of liturgically correct Gothic Revival stylistic elements, side porch, steeply pitched gabled roof, pointed arch openings, asymmetric plan, honest use of materials, and importance of the chancel. The church and its residential setting just north of downtown Valley City are in excellent condition. All Saints' is a distinctive tangible instance of a cultural heritage transplanted to the Plains. As such, it is an important remnant of the state's earliest settlement period, a period largely dominated by easterners and Canadians of English descent.

A unique feature in North Dakota is the presence of a bell cote. Open in the center, the bell cote was considered eminently suited to country parish churches in the 19th century. Its presence is evidence of the designers' awareness of Ecclesiologically correct Gothic Revival church design. In addition to the bell cote, several characteristics set All Saints' apart from others in the state from the period: brick trim (with quoins), paired pointed arch windows, and the jerkin-headed roofline of the offset chancel. Other elements are more characteristic of Episcopal churches in the state, including three lancet windows to light the chancel, a rose window at the other end of the nave, stained glass windows throughout, stone-bearing walls, and buttresses.

Unlike a number of other Episcopal examples from the 1880s (at Casselton, Buffalo, and Lisbon, for example), the one story Valley City church combines fieldstone with tan brick trim and does not have wood shingle in the gable ends. Brick is used for the bell cote, buttresses, corner quoins, at the foundation, as a continuous lintel for windows, and to form distinctive quoined arched window surrounds. Local split fieldstone, roughly dressed and laid up regularly with thick mortaring now with incised joints, is the primary wall material. The gabled roof, including the jerkin-headed chancel roof, is wood shingle, another instance of the "honest" use of materials.

The original plan of All Saints' (approximately 25x40') was properly asymmetric, with a side porch entry at the west (at the back of the nave), offset chancel at the south, and vestry at the east. Subsequent additions--an early 20th century parish hall and a small 1974 office--are located on either side of the vestry, with

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 2

the result that the outline of the church is now essentially square.

Interior arrangement and details continue the liturgically correct design of the exterior. An important defining feature are the bow-shaped wood hammer trusses which rest on heavy wood beams with pendants; three sets of trusses run along the nave (paired pointed arch windows are placed between them), one frames the chancel, and another is set into the rear nave wall. Attractive dark woodwork provides a richness and is used for the ceiling, at the pointed arch windows (moulded with diamond-shaped keystones and slender slightly turned pilasters), for the pews with kneelers, and as wainscotting.

The chancel is set apart in a symbolically correct manner. First, pews set perpendicular to those of the nave emphasize the separation between nave and chancel. Then a step running the width of the chancel provides a slightly elevated space within it. Finally, another step and a wood communion or altar rail divide the lower areas of the chancel from the altar space. The arrangement clearly points out the importance of the chancel and, within it, the most sacred of spaces, the altar.

Attached to the secondary side of the nave, the parish hall addition has two sets of large sliding wood doors inside that open to allow visual access to the nave; overflow crowds can therefore participate in the worship service with relative ease. Flat-roofed and one story, it is of appropriate scale to the church and continues the materials (fieldstone and tan brick), and some motifs of the original. According to the annual Convocation report for 1913, the parish hall addition was built in 1913 for \$4000. It is shown on the Sanborn fire insurance map for 1928. Measuring approximately 28x16', the addition consists of a simple open space with attached kitchen. Alterations are minor and to be expected in a still-functioning church: modern flooring and replacement lighting.

In 1974 a small office addition was built at the side rear corner between the chancel and the vestry. With its small size, tucked away location, and roofline compatible with the original, the addition is relatively unintrusive despite the use of vertical board and batten wood siding and long narrow rectangular windows. Other than these additions, there has been remarkably little change to the building. The bell cote and some of the mortar show signs of deterioration; entry doors are not original; some storm windows have been added; opaque panels above some windows are replacements or cover the original; and concrete entry steps are replacements.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 3

A brick chimney shown in a c. 1880 photo was removed at some unspecified time from the bell cote end of the nave.

All Saints' is located on a well-traveled street one block north of the principal commercial street in Valley City in a predominantly residential setting. Shrubs and trees dot the ample lawn, and an alley marks the east end of the corner site. A small Episcopal congregation continues to support the church.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 8. Statement of Significance Page 4

The first stone Episcopal church in North Dakota, All Saints' Episcopal Church in Valley City is a significant example of the property type, Episcopal Churches of North Dakota, 1872-1920s, for the multiple properties submission and context of the same name. The essentially unaltered building is significant at the state level under Criterion C (architecture), for it embodies the Gothic Revival Style, especially as it relates to the principles of the Episcopal Ecclesiological movement. Examples of this distinctive building type are unsurpassed in terms of unity of design, style, materials, and craft in North Dakota and comprise a significant architectural body of work. The church is also significant under Criterion A in the area of exploration/settlement, for it is an important remnant of the state's earliest settlement period, a period largely dominated by easterners and Canadians of English descent. As such, it may be one of the few extant examples in Valley City associated with this first period of settlement. Still used as an Episcopal church, All Saint's derives its primary significance from its architectural distinction (Criteria Consideration A). Built in 1881, All Saints' Church displays the key defining design elements listed under the registration requirements (side porch, steeply pitched roof, pointed arch openings, asymmetry, honest use of materials, chancel design). The period of significance for Criterion C covers when the building was constructed, and the period of significance for Criterion A is 1881-97. This period begins when the church was constructed during the first Dakota Boom (which began in 1878) and ends in 1897 with the close of this initial intense period of settlement.

All Saints' was built in 1881, during the initial developmental years of Valley City. Actively settled beginning in 1878, the community was established as a stop on the Northern Pacific Railway. (There had been desultory efforts to plat a townsite as early as 1872.) Settlement was rapid in the railtown, and by 1880 population reportedly stood at 1,000. Episcopalians were among the early arrivals and included influential town leaders; in 1877 there were three Episcopal families served by the still-unorganized Valley City mission station, according to Diocesan records. Among the 1880 arrivals was the Rev. Herbert Root, a leader in establishing the parish and building the present church.

Root appears to have had a major role in the design of the church. Born in Ontario, Canada, he moved to Illinois in 1860 and received his theological training at Nashotah Episcopal Seminary in Wisconsin, graduating in 1874. Root would have had ample opportunity to learn of Ecclesiologically proper Gothic church design at

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 8. Statement of Significance Page 5

the seminary and while serving churches in Illinois, Wisconsin, Indiana, and Minnesota.¹

The Rev. Root came to Valley City in March of 1880 and immediately announced his plans to leave the ministry and open a bank and real estate office. In June he and his wife donated town lots for the church, and it was "rumored that steps are to be taken for the erection of a church building on the lots this summer [1880]." Those ambitious plans were delayed slightly and construction took place in 1881. A December 1881 article boasted that "Not anywhere in the Northwest can be found a more perfect sanctuary...pure Gothic architecture...." The first services were held on Christmas Eve 1881, and it was formally dedicated on May 28, 1882.²

According to a history of the Diocese,

In 1881 under Root's direction, they began to build North Dakota's first stone church. Its Gothic design was dictated by Root, who contributed half a city block and a sum of money toward its construction.³

No architects' names have been associated with the design of the church in contemporary newspaper accounts or parish or Diocesan records. Changes to the interior not long after construction do suggest a less-than-professional designer. In the spring of 1883, church minutes reveal that church leaders discussed removing a row of pews to provide more space; in the winter of 1884 they decided to move the stoves closer to the center of the church. Available newspapers from the 1880s are scarce and the few examples are silent regarding the architect for the church.

Based on the history of the Diocese and Root's training, it seems reasonable that the design was largely the product of Root. Despite leaving the clergy, he apparently acted as a combined missionary and architect for the church, resulting in an excellent Gothic stone symbolically correct building. However, in the absence of more compelling information about Root's specific role,

¹*Compendium of History and Biography of North Dakota Containing a History of North Dakota.* Chicago: G.A. Ogle and Co., 1900. (entry for Herbert Root.)

²*Clay County Advocate*, March 25, 1880; *Valley City Times*, December 1881, quoted in Bicentennial Issue of the newspaper, July 14, 1976.

³Wilkins, Robert and Wynona. *God Giveth the Increase*, p. 18.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 8. Statement of Significance Page 6

responsibility for the design cannot be specifically assigned to him.

Despite the presence of a distinctive church, the Episcopal community in Valley City struggled. In 1881 there were then 30 families consisting of 100 "souls," of which only 29 were communicants in good standing. It is therefore all the more remarkable that the church was built without outside financial assistance, a unique occurrence among Episcopal parishes in the state. All Saints' was not elevated from mission status to parish standing until December 27, 1882, an indication of the small number of communicants. Root and the few other members of the congregation later had a falling out which resulted in a lawsuit which further hampered parish development. Diocesan reports for 1885 and 1887 contained no reference to the Valley City parish. The church was closed from 1887-89; then a lay reader began holding services. During the 1890s services were held sporadically. The parish struggled, then stabilized during the early years of the 20th century, during the second Dakota Boom, and mustered the wherewithal to build the parish hall addition. The church is an active but small and declining Episcopal parish. According to the Episcopal Diocese, it may be forced to close within the coming decade.

9. Major Bibliographical References

[X] See continuation sheet, section 9, page 1.

Previous documentation on file (NPS):

- preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
- previously listed in the National Register
- previously determined eligible by the National Register
- designated a National Historic Landmark
- recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey # _____
- recorded by Historic American Engineering Record # _____

Primary location of additional data:

- State historic preservation office
- Other state agency
- Federal agency
- Local government
- University
- Other

Specify repository: _____

10. Geographical Data

Acreege of property less than one acre

UTM References

A	1 4	5 7 6 0 2 0	5 1 9 7 4 6 0	B			
	Zone	Easting	Northing		Zone	Easting	Northing
C				D			

[] See continuation sheet, section 10, page 1.

Verbal Boundary Description

[X] See continuation sheet, section 10, page 1.

Boundary Justification

[X] See continuation sheet, section 10, page 1.

11. Form Prepared By

name/title	Barbara Beving Long, consultant	date	May 21, 1992
organization	Four Mile Research Company	telephone	(319) 547-4344
street & number	315 N. Elm Street	state	Iowa
city or town	Cresco	zip code	52136

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 9. Major Bibliographical References Page 7

- Long, Barbara Beving. Episcopal Churches of North Dakota. Multiple properties submission, 1992.
- All Saint's Episcopal Church. Minute Book. (covers October 3, 1882-July 30, 1885) Located at the church.
- "All Saints', Valley City." *The North Dakota Sheaf*, May 1903.
- "All Saints first church in county." *Valley City Times-Record*, Bicentennial Issue, July 14, 1976. (Includes quotes from 19th century newspaper accounts.)
- Wilkins, Robert and Wynona. *God Giveth the Increase. The History of the Episcopal Church in North Dakota.* Fargo: ND Institute for Regional Studies, 1959.
- Journals of the 12th, 13th, and 14th Annual Convocations...A.D. 1881, 1882, 1883.* N.P.: The Convocation, 1883.
- Journal of the 29th Annual Convocation of the Missionary District of North Dakota...May 25-27, A.D. 1913.* N.D.: [the Convocation], 1913.
- "All Saint's Episcopal Church." pamphlet at the church.
- Barnes County History.* Dallas: Taylor Publishing Company, 1976, p. 296.
- Clay County Advocate*, March 25, June 10, 1880.
- Compendium of History and Biography of North Dakota Containing a History of North Dakota.* Chicago: G.A. Ogle and Co., 1900. (Entry for Herbert Root.)
- Tabular Statement, September 10, 1877 to October 4, 1878 (in *Journals of the 9th, 10th, and 11th Annual Convocations...1878, 1879, 1880.* Mitchell: The Convocation, 1880.
- Valley City, North Dakota. Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, 1928.
- Diocese of North Dakota. Records. SHSND Archives #4600102.
- Roberts, Norene. Final Report on the 1986-87 National Register Reconnaissance Survey of Valley City, North Dakota. For SHSND. September 1987.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes County, ND

Section number 10. Geographical Data Page 8

Verbal Boundary Description

All Saints' Episcopal Church occupies lots 1-5, block 4, Original Town Plat, in Valley City, North Dakota.

Boundary Justification

The boundary includes the lots where the church stands that have historically been part of All Saints' Episcopal Church.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

All Saints' Episcopal Church, Barnes Co., ND

Section number PHOTOGRAPHS Page 9

•Photographer for all views: BJB Long

•Location of negatives for all views: State Historical Society of
North Dakota, Division of Archeology and Historic Preservation

•Date of photographs for all views: July 1991

ALL SAINTS' EPISCOPAL CHURCH, Barnes County, ND:

1. South facade (view to north)
2. South and west facades, showing flat-roofed addition on
north side of building (view to NE)
3. West facade (view to east)
4. East and south facades, showing small modern addition to NE
side (view to NW)