

United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service

64501100



## National Register of Historic Places Multiple Property Documentation Form

This form is used for documenting property groups relating to one or several historic contexts. See instructions in National Register Bulletin *How to Complete the Multiple Property Documentation Form* (formerly 16B). Complete each item by entering the requested information. For additional space, use continuation sheets (Form 10-900-a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer to complete all items.

☒ New Submission ☐ Amended Submission

## A. Name of Multiple Property Listing

Halaulani Place, 1917-1960

## B. Associated Historic Contexts

(Name each associated historic context, identifying theme, geographical area, and chronological period for each.)

Development and Growth of Hilo, 1900-1940

Development: of Halaulani Place, 1917-1960

## C. Form Prepared by

name/title Mason Architects, Inc.

organization \_\_\_\_\_

date February 20, 2009street & number 119 Merchant Street, Suite 501telephone (808) 536-0556city or town Honolulustate Hawaiizip code 96813

e-mail \_\_\_\_\_

## D. Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, I hereby certify that this documentation form meets the National Register documentation standards and sets forth requirements for the listing of related properties consistent with the National Register criteria. This submission meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR 60 and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archeology and Historic Preservation.

(See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature and title of certifying official

Date

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION  
State or Federal Agency or Tribal government

I hereby certify that this multiple property documentation form has been approved by the National Register as a basis for evaluating related properties for listing in the National Register.

Signature of the Keeper

Date of Action

Name of Multiple Property Listing: Halaulani Place	State: Hawaii
----------------------------------------------------	---------------

### Table of Contents for Written Narrative

Provide the following information on continuation sheets. Cite the letter and title before each section of the narrative. Assign page numbers according to the instructions for continuation sheets in National Register Bulletin *How to Complete the Multiple Property Documentation Form* (formerly 16B). Fill in page numbers for each section in the space below.

	Page Numbers
<b>E. Statement of Historic Contexts</b> (if more than one historic context is documented, present them in sequential order.)	1-3
<b>F. Associated Property Types</b> (Provide description, significance, and registration requirements.)	1
<b>G. Geographical Data</b>	1
<b>H. Summary of Identification and Evaluation Methods</b> (Discuss the methods used in developing the multiple property listing.)	1-3
<b>I. Major Bibliographical References</b> (List major written works and primary location of additional documentation: State Historic Preservation Office, other State agency, Federal agency, local government, university, or other, specifying repository.)	1-2

**Paperwork Reduction Act Statement:** This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties, and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 460 et seq.).

**Estimated Burden Statement:** Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18 hours per response including time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding this burden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, PO Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Project (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.

United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number E

Page 1

The multiple property nomination addressing the development of Halaulani Place from 1918 to 1960 contains descriptions, analysis, and evaluative tools for understanding the development of this historic subdivision located in Hilo, Hawaii, with regard to National Register criteria. In its initial phase the nomination touches upon two historic contexts addressing the development and growth of Hilo, and the actual development of the Halaulani Tract. The initial phase of the nomination includes eight of the thirteen residences on the street, which appear to meet the Hawaii and National Register of Historic Places criteria. The time frame for the nomination extends to 1960, as that is the date of construction for the two most recently constructed houses on the street, and within a year they will have attained the fifty year age articulated in the National Register criteria.

## Development and Growth of Hilo, 1900-1940

Prior to the arrival of foreigners, the native Hawaiian settlement at Hilo was concentrated at the mouth of the Wailoa River. However, when the missionaries arrived in 1823 and established Haili Church, the population shifted to that area centering on the present location of downtown Hilo. The town, the most far-removed port of call in the Hawaiian Islands from Honolulu, was during most of the nineteenth century a rather remote outpost in the eyes of western civilization. As late as 1840 the village was still without roads. After mid-century the town occasionally served as a stopover and supply point for the New England whalers, but did not receive anywhere near the traffic that Honolulu and Lahaina garnered, nor even as much as Koloa on Kauai. The town of Hilo did not rise to prominence until after the sugar industry became well established along the Hilo-Hamakua coast, and it was not until the construction of the railroad from Hilo to Paauilo during 1909-1913, which connected the sugar plantations of the Hamakua coast to Hilo, that the city's growth and prosperity accelerated. The completion of the railroad, coupled with the construction of a breakwater between 1909-1922, made Hilo the major port on the island of Hawaii, and for much of the twentieth century it was the second largest city in the island chain, as it was not until the early 1960s that Kailua on the island of Oahu surpassed Hilo in population.

## Development of Halaulani Place, 1917-1960

Halaulani Place is located in Hilo on the island of Hawaii. It is a small, slightly over thirteen acre, subdivision, that is geographically set apart from surrounding neighborhoods by its physical boundaries. To the east a thirty foot cliff drops to the Hawaii Belt Road, which originally was a railroad right of way for the Hawaii Consolidated Railway, Ltd.; to the west the area is bounded by the Mamalahoa Highway and Wainaku Drive, which originally was the primary automotive route into Hilo from the Hamakua coast. However, more importantly, it is bounded on both the north and south by the Kalalau and Pukihae streams, respectively. These strong geographic boundaries provide the area with an almost island-like quality.

At the time of the Mahele these lands were awarded to Princess Victoria Kamamalu through Land Commission Award 7713. Victoria Kamamalu was the granddaughter of Kamehameha I, through her mother, Kinau. Her father was Mataio Kekuanaoa, who descended from a lower ranking line of Hilo ali'i. Through various bequeaths the property eventually became part of the Bernice Pauahi Bishop Estate. In the early twentieth century the Bishop Estate's trustees contemplated developing this knoll between the two streams as a residential subdivision, and went so far as to prepare blueprints and maps for the new tract. A number of people came forward to express interest in purchasing a parcel in the proposed subdivision; however, for reasons unknown, on July 1, 1918 the Bishop Estate trustees instead sold the property in its entirety to the Security Trust Company of Hilo, which undertook the residential development. At that time the Bishop Estate trustees were: W.O. Smith, E.F. Bishop, A.F. Judd, William Williamson, and R.H. Trent.

The purchaser of the property, Security Trust Company, Ltd., had been incorporated in the previous year, beginning

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number E

Page 2

operations on February 1, 1917. Its board of directors included many prominent businessmen from the island of Hawaii, including its president, attorney W. H. Smith; vice president William Chalmers, who was president of Peoples Bank; secretary, M. De F. Spinola who was a realtor and financial agent; and treasurer and manager, H. A. Truslow. Its directors included hardware store owner P.C. Beamer, F.R. and W. H. Greenwell of Kona; district magistrate T.E. M. Osorio, homesteader J.G. Pratt, attorney and territorial senator J. W. Russell, and Charles Shimamoto, the vice president of the American Trading Company. The Security Trust Company subdivided the property into twenty large residential lots, and built a twenty foot wide "fine asphalt macadam roadway" that swept, "in a wide curve from the Wainaku Road down to the sea at the tip of the long tongue of land that comprises the tract." [PCA, May 9, 1918, p. 6] The road bisected the tract and a bridge carried it over the railroad track, which Bishop Estate had sold to the railway company in 1909, and which crossed near its ocean end. In developing the subdivision the Security Trust Company decided, "to follow as closely as possible the original plans of the Bishop Estate engineers and surveyors although there may be one or two slight changes when A.J. Williamson, into whose hands the trust company has placed the preliminary work of preparing the tract, completes his plans." [Ibid.] Williamson prepared or finalized the plans for the road and also the sidewalks and gutters, as well as a fifteen to twenty foot ornamental concrete bridge which was proposed to span the railroad cut that ran through a portion of the property. The bridge was to follow the drawings prepared by the Bishop Estate, but may not have been constructed, as a wood overpass, which unfortunately is no longer extant, serviced the road, at least since 1933. In addition, water, sewer and gas mains were laid, and the developers arranged with the Electric Light Company to install the wires so they would enter the houses from the rear, so there would be no "disfiguring poles" along the roadway. Each lot was laid out to have a view of Hilo Bay. The entire design was prepared, "to preserve the area as the finest residence subdivision in the city and the price will be such as to encourage immediate building." [Ibid.] The price of the lots ranged between \$1,750 and \$3,500, and some of the initial buyers included Dr. L.L. Sexton, George Russell, James W. Russell, H. A. Truslow, and H.J. Lyman.

The Security Trust Company, in addition to its involvement with the Halaulani Place tract, was involved with a number of other real estate development projects, having acquired and sold lots in Keawehane, the Wailaa Heights tract, Wailoa Heights, Waiakea, and Puueo, all of which are in Hilo. The trust company was closely linked with the People's Bank, with both organizations sharing many of the same directors and officers. In addition, the Securities Trading Company also had close dealings with the Security Trust Company, handling the acquisition and sale of stocks and securities. The People's Bank ran into fiscal difficulties in 1921 when the stock market, as well as sugar prices, dropped dramatically. The bank withstood a September 1921 run by its customers, but a second run on February 18, 1922, led to the closing of the bank. On Monday, February 20, 1922, the courts named the Waterhouse Trust Company, which had advanced the People's Bank \$250,000 to keep it afloat following the September run, as receiver for both the bank and the Security Trust Company. An investigation prompted by the failure of these financial organizations led to the conviction of their vice president, H.A. Truslow, for embezzlement. The Waterhouse Trust sold the Security Trust company's assets at auction in May 1922, including four lots on Halaulani Place.

The design of the subdivision followed the best planning and building practices of the time. Halaulani Place's picturesquely curving roadway lined with royal palms, large lots featuring houses set back from the road by lawns and landscaping, and the consigning of the utility poles to the rear of the lots all embodied the romantic visions of suburban residential neighborhoods which had been popular in the United States since at least the 1890s. Rising out of the City Beautiful and the Neighborhood movements, with their strong emphasis on the positive effects of an aesthetically pleasing environment upon human behavior, these residential developments evoked rural associations. Curving streets, spacious lots with generous setbacks, abundant vegetation, and diverse house forms differentiated the ideal suburban neighborhood from the more rectilinear grid of the city with its uniform rowhouses. Such designs offered a return to nature, a safe retreat for the raising of a family. The stone pillar at the entry to Halaulani Place marked not only the entry to the residential neighborhood, but also a clear social and economic boundary, just as the bridge connecting the ocean front lots to the remainder of the area, gave the ocean front point an enchanting and special aura the culmination of a



## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number E

Page 3

separate entity unto itself, with the bridge and solitary street its sole access to the city and its commercial cares. Other amenities, such as the concrete sidewalks lining both sides of the roadway and the four concrete lamp posts, further elucidated the refined character of the area. These features combined with the individual lots' unobstructed ocean views to make it one of the finest residential districts in Hilo, and in its early years it was known as "the gold coast." Such distinctive elements as the roadway, sidewalks, entry pillar, concrete lamp posts, and spacious lots with single family residences and mature trees lining the roadway are all significant elements contributing to the historic character of Halaulani Place, as is the absence of utility poles from the roadway.

The residential styles found in Halaulani Place by and large follow the bungalow tradition with its romantic, back-to-nature, arts and crafts associations. The sole exception, the Levi Lyman's two story colonial revival dwelling, maintained the precepts of the City Beautiful movement, as well as associations with the Lyman family's New England missionary past. The bungalows exhibit a variety of forms, articulating the individuality of the different home owners, with such distinct elements as the octagonal sitting room of the Truslow/Lyman house, the rounded corner lanai of the Moses residence, and the strong use of lava rock in the Williamson, Henderson and Hill/Shutte residences. At the same time, the houses are unified in their use of such bungalow elements as their floor plans, massing, and gable ends with figure four brackets, as well as their scale, methods of construction, high levels of craftsmanship, and use of materials, including local lava rock accents.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number F

Page 1

### Associated Property Types

Single family residences and their setting constitute the main property type associated with Halaulani Place during the period 1918-1960. These dwellings reflect the designs, materials, methods of construction and craftsmanship associated with their period of construction. The houses primarily follow bungalow and craftsman lines, which were popular in Hawaii and across the United States during the years 1912-1932. Period revival homes were also in vogue in Hawaii and the nation during the decades prior to World War II, and one colonial revival style home, the Lyman residence, is present on the street. The houses dating from the period 1950-1960 follow the then prevalent modern style of architecture. One, the Oda residence, incorporates Asian motifs, a common design trend of the period in the islands, and another, the Walter Irving and Jean Park Henderson residence was designed by Vladimir Ossipoff, one of the pre-eminent Honolulu architects of the time.

The houses share many common features. All are one or two stories in height, sit on large, spacious, lushly landscaped lots, and are wood framed, although lava rock frequently is used as a major design element. The commodious houses, most with over 1,700 square feet under roof, are readily visible from the street and the lots flow into one another, rarely interrupted by front or side walls or fences, with the exception of the Oda residence, but even in this instance, the wood front wall is pulled far back from the street. Almost all the houses have corrugated metal roofs, the preferred roofing material in Hilo, which sets the town architecturally apart from other parts of the state. The eaves of the roofs extend well beyond wall surfaces to provide protection from Hilo's one hundred and thirty five inches of rain per year. Because of the lots sloping down towards the streambeds on either side of the subdivision, most all of the houses have below grade basements, some of which have been finished to provide additional living space. On the interiors, beaded tongue and groove is a dominant material for walls and ceilings, with canec, a fiberboard manufactured on the island of Hawaii from sugar cane fiber starting in 1930, also present. Many of living rooms and dining rooms feature coffered ceilings.

United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet**

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number G

Page 1

---

**Geographic Information**

This nomination includes the lands originally platted as the Halaulani Tract, less the ocean fronting parcels which were connected to the remainder of the subdivision by a bridge. The bridge no longer exists, having been removed by the State Highways Division, as federal regulations discourage the spanning of federally funded highways by wood bridges. As part of this project, the County condemned the Halaulani Place ocean fronting properties and removed all the buildings that stood on that point. The area is described by Tax Map Key plat 2-6-006, with the exception of lots, 1, 2, 23, and 24.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State : Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable) :  
Halaulani Place

Section number H

Page 1

### Identification Methods

The Halaulani Place Multiple Property nomination builds on the Historic Sites Inventory Survey for the proposed Hilo Bayfront Highway project, which was undertaken in 1983 by Spencer Limited. At that time a visual survey of the area was performed and sufficient research and analysis was accomplished to establish that the area appeared to meet the criteria for listing in the Hawaii and national registers of historic places. This work included an examination of the Hawaii County tax records, interviews with residents and former residents, checking fire maps, and consulting such library sources as the newspapers, subscription biographies of the period, and materials at the Lyman House Museum.

In preparing the present nomination a more in-depth field survey was undertaken on February 17, 2009, which involved examining and recording the exteriors and interiors of the individual properties proposed for registration. Additional archival research was undertaken to better flesh out not only the historic contexts, but also bolster the information known concerning the individual houses. This research not only covered sources previously examined, but also of records held by the State Bureau of Conveyances, and State Survey Division. In addition, individual property owners contributed further information that they had garnered, including the extensive research files Tricia Lewis (resident) had gathered from various state agencies, the Hilo Public Library, and the Lyman House Museum, and newspaper research undertaken by Jane Stevenson (resident).

### Evaluation Methods

To assess the historic significance of the properties to be considered for listing in the Halaulani Place, 1917-1960 multiple property nomination, the national register criteria for evaluation of historic properties, shall be applied. To be considered historic, a property must have integrity, as well as meet one of the four criteria. The evaluation of integrity is sometimes a subjective judgment, but it must always be grounded in an understanding of a property's physical features and how they relate to its significance. The federal National Register program recognizes seven aspects or qualities that in various combinations define integrity. These seven aspects are:

- Location
- Design
- Setting
- Materials
- Workmanship
- Feeling
- Association

To retain historic integrity a property will always possess several, and usually most, of the aspects. The retention of specific aspects of integrity is paramount for a property to convey its significance. Because feeling and association depend on individual perceptions, their retention *alone* is never sufficient to consider a property historic.



## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number H

Page 2

### Location

Location is the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event occurred. The relationship between the property and its location is often important to understanding why the property was created or why something happened. Properties to be considered for the Halaulani Place multiple property nomination need to remain within the geographic boundaries discussed in section G.

### Design

Design is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property. It results from conscious decisions made during the original conception and planning of a property, as well as subsequent, historically significant alterations. Design includes such elements as organization of space, proportion, scale, technology, ornamentation, and materials. A property's design reflects historic functions and technologies as well as aesthetics. It includes such considerations as the structural system; massing; arrangement of spaces; pattern of fenestration; textures and colors of surface materials; type, amount, and style of ornamental detailing; and arrangement and type of plantings in a designed landscape.

Properties to be considered for the Halaulani Place multiple property nomination need to retain their integrity of design. The major stylistic and structural elements of the exterior and interior of the buildings need to remain intact. These would include giving consideration to the building's historic relationship to the street, the retention of exterior massing, materials and historic design of the façade. The retention of the historic materials and spatial configurations of the house's public spaces, and to a lesser extent to its bedrooms. Great latitude is given for kitchen and bathroom remodelings.

The retention of integrity of design characteristics will enable the Halaulani Place houses to be considered eligible under criteria C for listing in the Hawaii and national registers of historic places.

### Setting

Setting is the physical environment of a historic property. Whereas location refers to the specific place where a property was built, setting refers to the character of the place in which the property played its historical role. It involves, not just where, the property is situated, but its relationship to surrounding features and open space. The physical features that constitute the setting of a historic property can be either natural or manmade, and may include such elements as, topographic features, vegetation, and relationships between buildings and other features or open space.

Properties to be considered for the Halaulani Place multiple property nomination need to retain their integrity of historic setting. Their relationship to the street, the streams, and each other, unobstructed by walls or fences, needs to be considered. Fencing at the rear of the property does not intrude upon the character of the neighborhood, and transparent barriers along the street need to be evaluated on a case by case basis. Most of the original view planes to the ocean have been obstructed by vegetation and the maintenance of this historic characteristic in many instances should not weigh heavily in the decision-making process.

### Workmanship

Workmanship is the physical evidence of the craftsmanship of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory. It is the evidence of artisans' labor and skill in constructing or altering a building. Workmanship can apply to the property as a whole or to its individual components. It can be expressed in vernacular methods of construction and plain finishes or in highly sophisticated configurations and ornamental detailing. It can be based on common traditions or innovative period techniques.

**National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet**

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number H

Page 3

The workmanship at the houses along Halaulani Place is typical of the high level carpentry skills of its time, and should be present in properties to be considered for the Halaulani Place multiple property nomination.

**Feeling**

Feeling is a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time. It results from the presence of physical features that, taken together, convey the property's historic character.

Properties to be considered for the Halaulani Place multiple property nomination which retain sufficient original design, materials, workmanship, and setting, convey the feeling of the Security Trust Company's intention to provide a well designed subdivision of the highest level of quality.

**Association**

Association is the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property. A property retains association if it is the place where the event or activity occurred and is sufficiently intact to convey that relationship to an observer. Like feeling, association requires the presence of physical features that convey a property's historic character.

Properties to be considered for the Halaulani Place multiple property nomination need to maintain such associations through their setting, design, materials and craftsmanship. The maintenance of such characteristics will enable the properties to be considered eligible under criteria A for listing in the Hawaii and national registers of historic places.

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number I

Page 1

Bibliography

Bishir, Catherine W. and Lawrence S. Earley, *Early Twentieth Century Suburbs in North Carolina*, Raleigh: North Carolina Department of Cultural Resources, Division of Archives and History, 1985.

George, Milton, *The Development of Hilo, Hawaii, TH*, Ann Arbor, Michigan: The Edwards Letter Shop, December 1948.

Gowans, Alan, *The Comfortable House, North American Suburban Architecture, 1890-1930*, Cambridge, MIT Press, 1986.

*Hawaii Herald*

"Resignations Announced in Hilo Banking Circles," December 9, 1921, page 1

"Vicars Named Manager, Fills Truslow Chair," December 21, 1921, page 1

"Truslow Found Guilty," July 6, 1922, page 3

"Herbert Truslow Given Sentence by Judge Banks," July 13, 1922, page 3

Hayden, Dolores, *The Grand Domestic Revolution: A History of Feminist Designs for American Homes, Neighborhoods and Cities*, Cambridge: MIT Press, 1981.

*Hilo Tribune-Herald*

"New Trust Company for Hilo Organized," January 10, 1917, page 2.

Advertisement, "The Security Trust Co. Ltd., February 7, 1917, page 3.

"Saturday Run on Bank," February 19, 1922, page 1.

"Waterhouse Trust is Receiver," February 21, 1922, page 1.

"Lewis Explains His Attitude as Final Adjudicator," February 22, 1922, page 1.

*Honolulu Star Bulletin*

"Jury Not Yet Completed for Truslow Trial," June 8, 1922, page 1.

"Truslow Case Left to Jury Decision," June 16, 1922, page 1.

"Testimony is Taken in Third Truslow Trial," June 28, 1922, page 1.

"Truslow Put on Stand in Own Defense," June 29, 1922, page 1.

"H.A. Truslow is Guilty by Jury's Verdict," July 1, 1922, page 1.

United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Name of Property: Halaulani Place

County and State: Hawaii, Hawaii

Name of multiple property listing (if applicable):  
Halaulani Place

Section number 1

Page 2

*Pacific Commercial Advertiser*

"Opening of Tract Will Aid Growth of City of Hilo," May 9, 1918, page 6.

"Building Tract is Planned for Hilo," June 27, 1918, page 2.

Spencer Limited, "Historic Sites Survey, Hilo Bayfront Highway," Honolulu: VTN Pacific, Ltd., 1983.

State Bureau of Conveyances, Book 510, page .38

Stilgoe, John R., *Borderland, Origins of the American Suburb, 1820-1939*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988.

Wright, Gwendolyn, *Building the Dream, A Social History of Housing*, New York: Pantheon Books, 1981.

## HALAULANI PLACE, 1917-1960 MPS Hilo, Hawaii

---

### National Register Review Comments

#### Cover Documentation

The documentation provided in the Multiple Property Submission (MPS) cover *minimally* meets the National Register standards and provides basic information sufficient for evaluating properties related to the historic development of the exclusive residential subdivision of Halaulani Place during the first half of the twentieth century. While the documentation traces the development history of this particular subdivision, it provides very little justification for why this particular subdivision stands out from among other contemporary areas of the Hilo community. A brief notation regarding the use of the term "gold coast" for the area during the historic period is not supported by any additional context regarding the general patterns of Hilo residential development during the period of significance or the existence of other similar properties or subdevelopments. The nomination assumes an understanding of the special nature of these local resources without providing adequate contextual information to strongly support such a position. Several of the individual properties nominated under the MPS cover, thanks to their scale and degree of design, support the proposed themes, but other lesser examples are not as strongly justified.

The area in question would probably have been a stronger candidate for listing as a historic district, in which the sum of the parts equals a unique historical and architectural resource. In such a scenario borderline properties, like the McGuinness House, with low design integrity might well have qualified as contributing resources to the larger district. In such a district, elements of the general setting and subdivision landscape could have also been recognized and included as contributing resources supportive of the unique character of the area (sidewalks, curbing, narrow street, tree canopy, vegetated stream bed). A cursory view of the subdevelopment properties not included in the MPS nomination does not appear to reveal substantial intrusions to a potential district.

Section F of an MPS cover document should contain a discussion of the registration requirements for the property types outlined by the MPS. Much of this information is contained in the Methodology section (H) of the document rather than in Section F. The materials minimally establish evaluation requirements for the physical integrity of the residential designs, but provide little assistance in identifying and documenting the appropriate criteria and areas of significance for the resources.

In particular, several of the nominations argue for eligibility under Criterion B. The MPS provides no direction or context regarding the evaluation of individual property owners or the level of supporting information necessary to merit consideration under this Criterion. In most cases the individual nominations provide no comparative information regarding the significant contributions of the people, or the existence of other properties associated with their active life and careers. For example, a number of the individuals share a common association with the Hilo Boarding School, but no contextual information is provided in the MPS regarding the historic significance of this institution to the local Hilo



community or why such associations might be deemed significant. These common associations are probably best recognized in the cover document as a means of highlighting the general status of the subdivision's residents as influential local citizens. In most cases individual eligibility is not justified at this time without additional supportive materials and Criterion B has been removed.

The MPS cover documentation fails to acknowledge the 1997 individual listing of the A. J. Williamson Residence in the National Register under Criterion C.

#### **Patrick and Ethel McGuinness Residence-Return**

The nomination form for the McGuinness Residence is being returned because it fails to justify the eligibility of the resource based on the significant changes to the historic home. The narrative description highlights several significant alterations to the historic design and materials of this circa 1921 house, including the removal and replacement of the original wood siding, the replacement of all original windows, the enclosure of the once dominant open front porch and the resulting change to the entry sequence, the removal of exterior walls (porch/living room area), and the 2000 addition of the ohana unit and carport. The cumulative impact of all these changes has dramatically affected the historic integrity of this self-described "modest" bungalow. While such changes might be allowable for a contributing resource in a historic district, buildings submitted for individual listing are usually held to a much higher standard, particularly in light of the existence of other adjacent resources that convey the same historic themes.

The current justification for integrity is not convincing and seems to conflict with the integrity qualifications outlined in the MPS cover document. Regardless of the criteria selected, the property needs to retain physical integrity. If additional material is available to support a stronger argument for the integrity and eligibility of this resource, the nomination can be revised and resubmitted.

Please note that the digital images submitted with the nominations do not currently meet the NR photo policy standards. The 72 dpi format does not conform to our standards. Since the photos were of sufficiently high resolution, our digitization staff will be able to adequately convert the files. In future nominations we ask that you provide the .tiffs at a minimum of 300 dpi.

---

#### **Henderson, Walter Irving and Jean, House – Listed w/ SLR**

##### **Certification:**

The documentation was submitted by the nominating authority as a "nomination" that "meets" the National Register Criteria.

[The certification blocks on the nomination form were inadvertently left blank and have now been corrected.]

#### **Hill, W. H. House – Listed w/ SLR**

##### **Certification:**

The documentation was submitted by the nominating authority as a "nomination" that "meets" the National Register Criteria.

[The certification blocks on the nomination form were inadvertently left blank and have now been corrected.]

### **Lyman, Levi and Netti, House**

#### **Certification:**

The documentation was submitted by the nominating authority as a "nomination" that "meets" the National Register Criteria.

[The certification blocks on the nomination form were inadvertently left blank and have now been corrected.]

#### **Significance:**

The Period of Significance should be noted as: 1922—1959, to correspond with the other resources nominated under the MPS.

*Criterion B* is deleted from the nomination, as are the Areas of Significance *Education and Law*, and *Levi Lyman and Merrill Carlsmith* as Significant Persons. [While Lyman and Carlsmith appear to have been local professionals the nomination provides insufficient context with which to understand the relative significance of their contributions, or the existence of other properties that may be associated with their active careers. In order to establish significance under *Criterion B* it is necessary to apply a comparative analysis to help evaluate the relative importance of the individuals and the single property most representative of that persons significant contributions during his productive life (in this case that might include other homes, offices, and social institutions).]

### **Moses, Edward H. and Claire, House**

#### **Certification:**

The documentation was submitted by the nominating authority as a "nomination" that "meets" the National Register Criteria.

[The certification blocks on the nomination form were inadvertently left blank and have now been corrected.]

#### **Significance:**

*Criterion B* is deleted from the nomination, as is *E. H. Moses* as a Significant Persons. [While Moses appears to have been local professional, the nomination provides insufficient context with which to understand the relative significance of his contributions, or the existence of other properties that may be associated with his active career. In order to establish significance under *Criterion B* it is necessary to apply a comparative analysis to help evaluate the relative importance of the individual and the single property most representative of that persons contributions during his productive life (in this case that might include other homes, offices, and social institutions).]

### **Parker, James and Catherine, House**

#### **Certification:**

The documentation was submitted by the nominating authority as a "nomination" that "meets" the National Register Criteria.

[The certification blocks on the nomination form were inadvertently left blank and have now been corrected.]

### **Truslow, Herbert Austin, House**

#### **Certification:**

The documentation was submitted by the nominating authority as a "nomination" that "meets" the National Register Criteria.

[The certification blocks on the nomination form were inadvertently left blank and have now been corrected.]

**Significance:**

*Criterion B* is deleted from the nomination, as is *Ellen G. Lyman* as a Significant Person. [While Lyman appears to have been local professional, the nomination provides insufficient context with which to understand the relative significance of her contributions, or the existence of other properties that may be associated with her active career. In order to establish significance under Criterion B it is necessary to apply a comparative analysis to help evaluate the relative importance of the individual and the single property most representative of that persons contributions during his or her productive life (in this case that might include other homes, offices, and social institutions).]

If you have questions regarding these comments, please contact me directly at the number or e-mail listed below.

---

Paul R. Lusignan, Historian  
(for) Keeper of the National Register  
(202) 354-2229  
[Paul\\_lusignan@nps.gov](mailto:Paul_lusignan@nps.gov)

S:\nr\lusi\ltemp\halaulanip  
acemps.rtn

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR  
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES  
EVALUATION/RETURN SHEET

REQUESTED ACTION: COVER DOCUMENTATION

MULTIPLE Halaulani Place, 1917-1960 MPS  
NAME:

STATE & COUNTY: HAWAII, HAWAII

DATE RECEIVED: 01/13/11 DATE OF PENDING LIST:  
DATE OF 16TH DAY: DATE OF 45TH DAY: 02/28/11  
DATE OF WEEKLY LIST:

REFERENCE NUMBER: 64501100

REASONS FOR REVIEW:

APPEAL: N DATA PROBLEM: N LANDSCAPE: N LESS THAN 50 YEARS: N  
OTHER: N PDIL: N PERIOD: N PROGRAM UNAPPROVED: N  
REQUEST: Y SAMPLE: N SLR DRAFT: N NATIONAL: N  
NEW MPS: Y

COMMENT WAIVER: N

\_\_\_ ACCEPT \_\_\_ RETURN \_\_\_ REJECT \_\_\_ DATE

ABSTRACT/SUMMARY COMMENTS:

**ACCEPT COVER DOCUMENTATION**

RECOM./CRITERIA Accept Cover Doc.

REVIEWER PAUL R. Lusignea DISCIPLINE HISTORIAN

Phone 202.354.2229 Date 2/28/11

DOCUMENTATION see attached comments Y/N see attached SLR Y/N

If a nomination is returned to the nominating authority, the nomination is no longer under consideration by the National Park Service.







NAME OF PROPERTY : Halawani Place, 1917-1960  
CITY OR VICINITY: Hilo  
COUNTY : Hawaii  
STATE : HI  
NAME OF PHOTOGRAPHER : Don Hibbard  
DATE OF PHOTOGRAPH : February 17, 2009  
LOCATION OF ORIGINAL DIGITAL FILE : 119  
Merchant St, #501, Honolulu,  
HI 96813

DESCRIPTION OF VIEW : Intersection of Wainaku St.  
and Halawani Place, camera  
facing Northeast.  
NUMBER OF PHOTOGRAPHS : Photo #1 of 2







NAME OF PROPERTY: Halaulani Place, 1917-1960  
CITY OR VICINITY: Hilo

COUNTY: Hawaii  
STATE: HI

NAME OF PHOTOGRAPHER: Don Hibbard

DATE OF PHOTOGRAPH: February 17, 2009

LOCATION OF ORIGINAL DIGITAL FILE: 119  
Merchant St, #501, Honolulu,  
HI 96813

DESCRIPTION OF VIEW: Halaulani Place, camera  
facing EAST.

NUMBER OF PHOTOGRAPHS: Photo #2 of 2

NEIL ABERCROMBIE  
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



**STATE OF HAWAII**  
**DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

POST OFFICE BOX 621  
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

WILLIAM J. AILA, JR.  
INTERIM CHAIRPERSON  
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

GUY H. KAULUKUKUI  
FIRST DEPUTY

WILLIAM M. TAM  
INTERIM DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER


AQUATIC RESOURCES  
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION  
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES  
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT  
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS  
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT  
ENGINEERING  
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION  
LAND  
STATE PARKS

**DATE:** December 29, 2010  
**TO:** Paul Lusignan  
**FROM:** Hawaii State Historic Preservation Division  
**SUBJECT:** Halaulani Street Nomination to the National Register of Historic Places

Enclosed is the district nomination and supporting paperwork for Halaulani Place on the island of Hawaii. I believe that I have followed your instructions re significance and signatures on the first pages. If you have any questions, please contact me at [ross.w.stephenson@hawaii.gov](mailto:ross.w.stephenson@hawaii.gov) or my cell at (808) 497-2233.

I hope this is just the beginning of many new listings from Hawaii on the NR.

Hauoli makahiki hou (happy new year) and mahalo (thank you).

  
Ross W. Stephenson  
Historian  
Hawaii Historic Preservation Division