

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

OCT 19 1992

National Register of Historic Places Registration Form

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations of eligibility for individual properties or districts. See instructions in Guidelines for Completing National Register Forms (National Register Bulletin 16). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the requested information. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, styles, materials, and areas of significance, enter only the categories and subcategories listed in the instructions. For additional space use continuation sheets (Form 10-900a). Type all entries.

1. Name of Property

historic name ST. PAUL'S EPISCOPAL CHURCH
other names/site number St. Paul's Church

2. Location

street & number 404 DeSmet St. N/A not for publication
city, town Rugby N/A vicinity
state North Dakota code ND county Pierce code 069 zip code 58368

3. Classification

Ownership of Property	Category of Property	Number of Resources within Property	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> private	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> building(s)	Contributing	Noncontributing
<input type="checkbox"/> public-local	<input type="checkbox"/> district	<u>1</u>	_____ buildings
<input type="checkbox"/> public-state	<input type="checkbox"/> site	_____	_____ sites
<input type="checkbox"/> public-Federal	<input type="checkbox"/> structure	_____	_____ structures
	<input type="checkbox"/> object	_____	_____ objects
		<u>1</u>	_____ Total

Name of related multiple property listing:
Episcopal Churches of North Dakota Number of contributing resources previously listed in the National Register N/A

4. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, I hereby certify that this nomination request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60.

In my opinion, the property meets does not meet the National Register criteria. See continuation sheet.

James E. Sperry North Dakota SHPO 10-13-92
Signature of certifying official Date

State Historical Society of North Dakota
State or Federal agency and bureau

In my opinion, the property meets does not meet the National Register criteria. See continuation sheet.

Signature of commenting or other official Date

State or Federal agency and bureau

5. National Park Service Certification

I, hereby, certify that this property is:

- entered in the National Register. See continuation sheet
- determined eligible for the National Register. See continuation sheet.
- determined not eligible for the National Register.

removed from the National Register.

other, (explain:)

~~Entered in the
National Register~~

Allover Byler 12/3/92

Signature of the Keeper

Date of Action

6. Function or Use

Historic Functions (enter categories from instructions)

RELIGION/religious facility

Current Functions (enter categories from instructions)

RECREATION AND CULTURE/museum

7. Description

Architectural Classification

(enter categories from instructions)

Late Gothic Revival

Materials (enter categories from instructions)

foundation stone

walls stone

roof asphalt

other wood/shingle

Describe present and historic physical appearance.

[X] See continuation sheet, section 7.

8. Statement of Significance

Certifying official has considered the significance of this property in relation to other properties:

nationally statewide locally

Applicable National Register Criteria A B C D

Criteria Considerations (Exceptions) A B C D E F G

Areas of Significance

(Enter categories from instructions)

Architecture

Period of Significance

1903

Significant Dates

1903

Cultural Affiliation

N/A

Significant Person

N/A

Architect/Builder

DeRemer, Joseph Bell - architect

State significance of property, and justify criteria, criteria considerations, and areas and periods of significance noted above.

[X] See continuation sheet, section 8.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 1

St. Paul's Episcopal Church in Rugby displays the key defining elements of the property type, Episcopal Churches of North Dakota, 1872-1920s. These features are the presence of Gothic or Late Gothic Revival stylistic elements, side porches, steeply pitched gabled roof, pointed arch openings, asymmetric plan, honest use of materials, and importance of the chancel. Built in 1903, the essentially intact church and its immediate surroundings near downtown Rugby are in good condition. St. Paul's is a highly distinctive tangible representation of a cultural heritage transplanted to the Plains.

St. Paul's Church is essentially one story but is set upon a raised basement on an uneven site. Thus, basement windows on the south are full height but are at ground level. The nave of the church and side porches (vestibule and vestry) are gabled, and the apse is hipped but also has a gabled portion. The large front-facing gable of the nave dominates the design. The two side porches have their entrances at the side rather than the gable end. The unusual arrangement allows access from the front facade, perhaps a recognition of the building's somewhat cramped placement mid-block between two houses.

The wall material is local split fieldstone, roughly dressed and well laid up in courses (especially on the main facades). No particular color dominates, but pinks, greys, and tans are well represented. Stones on the primary facades are more rectangular and well fitted together than the more boulder-like stones to the rear of the building, presumably a cost-saving measure. Some of the stones are two to three feet long and, overall, vary greatly in dimensions. Raised false mortar joints are used, a technique found on other stone Episcopal churches in the state.

Early accounts discussed the importance of fieldstone to the congregation. In 1905 the church was described as being constructed "out of the boulders, mostly of granite in various shades of red and grey, which strew our prairies--brought here on the ice from the far north during the ancient glacial period." A later local historical account emphasized the high regard held for the stonework, noting that St. Paul's "has the distinction of being

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 2

built of home materials, stones picked up on the surrounding prairies nicely trimmed and fitted into walls of the church."¹

St. Paul's Church displays elements which are characteristic of Late Gothic Revival Episcopal churches in the state, including stained or colored glass windows throughout, stone walls, and wood shingle in the gable ends (here, stained green). Corners are extended in the manner of buttresses for the main facade and side porches, imparting a feeling of solidity and strength. The windows have brownish or amber colored squares; particularly elaborate examples at the ends of the naves and in the side porches also display brilliant blues and golds in distinctive organic patterns. The various textures represented in the church contrast effectively with one another, properly calling attention to the "honesty" of the materials.

While the church displays important character-defining Gothic Revival elements, their treatment (and other features) reflect the early 20th century construction date of the church. For example, the large nave-end window is pointed arched, a familiar shape, but it is heavily recessed from the wood shingle wall surface, a decidedly early 20th century treatment, as are provision of useful basement space and the construction methods employed. Also, not all windows are pointed arched, for those along the nave and the basement (five sets) are heavily recessed and rectangular. Indeed, original plans called for no Gothic arch openings at all, but for a 4' rose window in the apse, simple louvers in the gable ends of the side porches, and rectangular windows elsewhere. It was only with the donation of stained glass windows from a New York City congregation that plans were changed, and the present pointed arch windows placed in the apse, side porches, and main facade.

The plan of St. Paul's Church (approximately 34x57') is properly asymmetric. Off the basic rectangle of the east-west nave are two side porches to the north and the apse to the west. The arrangement departs from traditional practices of placing the chancel toward the rising sun and the side or south porches on the warming south side. On the south side is a small hipped roofed enclosed basement entrance; materials (wood shingle walls) match those of the church and it has a stone foundation, suggesting that it was built at or not long after initial construction. The architect's plans show only a door with no projecting enclosure. Certain

¹"A New Church and An Ordination," *The North Dakota Sheaf*, February 1905; O.T. Tofsrud, *Fifty Years in Pierce County*. 1943, p. 69.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 3

alterations from before or during construction are known (pointed arch windows, slight change in dimensions penciled onto plans), and it seems likely the basement entrance also dated from those changes.

The asymmetric plan, uneven site, and bulky buttress-like effect make for an interesting play of shapes for St. Paul's. Stone wall surfaces were apparently of considerable importance to the congregation, a reflection of the continuing symbolic value of stone churches to North Dakota Episcopalians. Perhaps for reasons of economy and the lack of expert stone masons, plans do not call for solid stone wall construction. In the specifications, architect De Remer emphasized this point:

It is also to be understood that the building is to be framed in the same manner as though it were to be a frame building, and the stone wall is simply built on the outside enclosing same.²

The architect's specifications and the plans called for the foundation and face work to be "of local stone, laid in Northern Hydraulic Cement, mixed one to three parts." The local stone for the face work was "dressed, hand laid in coursed ashlar," as specified. After it was laid up, workers went "over and point[ed] all face work with Portland Cement Mortar mixed one to one using a convex joint, using care so as not to spread the mortar over the stones."

Window sills were also of cement, further reflecting the 20th century construction date. Details about framing reveal how the architect approached the unusual problem of a boulder-faced frame building.

The frame is to be covered over on the exterior with #3 boards, and the wall built right in solid to the same. The mason must use care and see that the wall is filled solid with mortar and small stones; he must also use care in the bonding of his walls. He shall also tie the stone work to the frame work by the use of iron ties 12" long this [sic] is to be made from 1/4" x 1" iron turned up 1" on the end and shortened on the other end and to be driven in the studding. From two rows of these ties placed every fifth studding, place one row at the bottom of windows and the other row 6" from the top.

²De Remer, Specifications for...St. Paul's Mission at Rugby, North Dakota, [1903.]

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 7. Description Page 4

Metal beams were also used at the basement level windows. Although it appears that the windows have stone lintels and are "punched" into the stone, narrow metal lintels are visible upon closer inspection. The upper story rectangular windows, which run in five bays along the nave, are fitted up next to the eaves and have no separate lintels.

Interior arrangement and details continue the liturgically correct Late Gothic Revival design of the exterior. An important defining feature are the four sets of heavy wood cross trusses and the fine wood ceiling. Two steps separate the nave from the chancel, and there is also an altar rail and another step up to the sanctuary. The arrangement clearly points out the importance of the chancel and, within it, the most sacred of spaces, the altar.

Interior details are relatively simple. There are ten rows of original wood pews (kneeling benches removed), wood wainscoting throughout with white painted plaster walls above, and simple wood window framing. Three sets of simple small drop globes are original and light the nave. The simplicity of materials and their honest portrayal serve to highlight the more dramatic features, the ceiling trusses and the distinctive stained glass windows whose amber tones provide a warm and glowing light in the nave.

According to a February 1905 account in *The North Dakota Sheaf*, the windows came from Holy Trinity Parish in New York City. When that church was razed, they sent the windows to Rugby. Of "refined pattern and color," they arrived "in a dilapidated condition, and of course not in frames commensurate with the openings in St. Paul's Church." Since there were no skilled workmen in town and the parish would not afford to send them away for renovation, members of the congregation took on the project. Their work was of sufficient quality that the windows remain in place and in good condition.

The type of alterations to St. Paul's are expected and acceptable. The present asphalt shingle roof replaced the original wood shingle version in the 1950s. As is to be expected with uneven shapes of stone, considerable mortar was sometimes necessary, and this mortar has deteriorated in places and new mortar applied, especially at the east end of the south side. According to a longtime parishioner, the present wood double entry doors replaced the originals around 1946. Now that the building no longer serves as a church, the Diocese has removed the altar and other furnishings and placed them in other churches in the state. The altar is presently in the parish hall at Grace Church, Jamestown.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 7. Description **Page** 5

St. Paul's Church is located on a mid-block site several blocks south of the principal commercial section of Rugby. The presence of numerous mature deciduous and evergreen trees makes photographing the church a challenge. The immediate surroundings are primarily older residential and include several fieldstone-covered buildings. According to a 1987-88 survey of Rugby, there were over 30 fieldstone structures or buildings in town, including five houses, a commercial buildings, and 25 walls or retaining walls. Such a wall separates the St. Paul property from its neighbor to the south.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 8. Statement of Significance Page 6

A frame church with massive fieldstone covering, St. Paul's Episcopal Church in Rugby is a significant example related to the multiple property submission, context, and property type, Episcopal Churches of North Dakota, 1872-1920s. The building is significant at the state level under Criterion C (architecture), for it embodies the Late Gothic Revival Style. Examples of this distinctive building type are unsurpassed in terms of unity of design, style, materials, and craft in North Dakota and comprise a significant architectural body of work. The church illustrates continuing interest on the Plains in the principles of the Episcopal Ecclesiological movement. Now privately owned, the church derives its primary significance from its architectural distinction (Criteria Consideration A). Built in 1903, St. Paul's Church displays the key defining design elements listed under the registration requirements (side porches, steeply pitched roof, pointed arch openings, asymmetry, honest use of materials, chancel design, Late Gothic Revival stylistic attributes). The period of significance, 1903, covers when the church was built. St. Paul's is a remarkable and tangible instance of a cultural heritage transplanted to the Plains, one which persisted into the 20th century.

The history St. Paul's Episcopal Church dates from 1891 when the Bishop of North Dakota brought his Cathedral Car to the community on a missionary visit. However, it was not until 1900 that services were held with any regularity in Rugby. The following year St. Paul's Mission was organized and services held more regularly in the courthouse. Under the leadership of the Rev. Philip Cook beginning in 1902, the congregation entertained hopes of building a church. By November they had purchased lots with plans to build in the spring despite the absence of a resident rector. These lots were sold in the spring of 1903 in order to make a profit of \$95. By June it could be reported that new lots had been purchased, "fenced, plowed and trees set out."³

Reports for July 1903 from the Rev. Cook detailed construction progress:

The work on the church building has begun--at least enough and probably more than enough stone has been bought and is on the

³[History of St. Paul's Mission.] Untitled typewritten in #46201313, SHSND Archives; Rugby reports, *The North Dakota Sheaf*, November 1902, June 1903.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 8. Statement of Significance Page 7

ground. The excavation will be begun shortly. Our plans are for a stone church--60x28--and when it is completed we expect to have one of the most attractive little churches in this part of the country. We shall keep the cost under \$2000.⁴

Cornerstone laying ceremonies were held on September 25, 1903. By then, the basement walls were in place, and it was hoped that the rest of the walls and the roof would be up by Thanksgiving. However, in November it was reported that while the walls were completed, their construction was so expensive that they were "brought to a standstill," still lacking a roof.⁵

Reports regarding the church contained references to the agricultural economy and its effect on church construction. In November of 1902 it was reported that "the crop here has been even poorer than elsewhere, which is a hindrance [to building plans]." And, "If the crop is as good as we all expect, all will be well." Unfortunately, "the almost total failure of crops in [the] vicinity" brought construction to a standstill the fall of 1903. With only a dozen families totaling 30 people of which 25 were communicants in 1903, St. Paul's was indeed struggling to survive and complete the church.⁶

Construction resumed during the spring and summer of 1904, and on January 25, 1905, the first services were held in the church. The congregation and distinguished visitors sat on chairs, for the pews and altar had not yet arrived. The weather was particularly bitter, "mercury 25 below zero and a strong wind blowing," but roses, carnations and Bermuda lilies adorned the temporary altar, and the choir as well as a violinist and cellist provided music.⁷

St. Paul's at Rugby joined churches at Minot and Towner as the focus of Episcopal missionary work in the northwest part of the state at the turn of the century. However, the work extended "over

⁴Rugby report, *Sheaf*, July 1903. The dimensions were increased from 28' to 34' and a later source stated that it cost \$2500.

⁵"Corner Stone of St. Paul's Church, Rugby," *Sheaf*, October 1903; Rugby report, *Sheaf*, November 1903.

⁶Rugby reports, *Sheaf*, November 1902, July, November 1903; *Convocation Journal*, 1903, p. 28.

⁷"A new church and an ordination," *Sheaf*, February 1905.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 8. Statement of Significance Page 8

and should include all the towns on the nearly 300 miles of railroad and in five counties," according to a 1903 account in the *Sheaf*. As in the 1880s, home missionary efforts ran along rail lines.

Grand Forks architect Joseph Bell De Remer provided the plans for St. Paul's Church in Rugby. One report assigns considerable credit to the Rev. Philip Cook, stating "to him is due the determination of the people to enter upon and carry out this work, and also the excellent plan of the structure."⁸ It appears that, as with other North Dakota churches, responsibility for the design was collective, with the Episcopal priest providing guidance. However, the presence of plans and specifications clearly by De Remer and the extremely similar plans he provided for the Episcopal church at Langdon suggest that primary responsibility may properly be assigned to him.

St. Paul's closed around 1978 and remained vacant until 1991. A local funeral director has purchased the building for community use, including mounting exhibits.

⁸*Sheaf*, February 1905.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 9. Major Bibliographical References Page 9

•Long, Barbara Beving. Episcopal Churches of North Dakota. Multiple properties submission, 1992.

•Wilkins, Robert and Wynona. *God Giveth the Increase. The History of the Episcopal Church in North Dakota.* Fargo: ND Institute for Regional Studies, 1959.

•Diocese of North Dakota. Records. SHSND Archives #4600102.

•De Remer, Joseph Bell. Plans for a one story and basement stone and frame church to be erected for St. Paul's Mission at Rugby, N.D., August 1903 and Specifications for Plan No. 115, St. Paul's Mission at Rugby, North Dakota, [1903.] #44012, SHSND Archives.

•"A New Church and An Ordination." *The North Dakota Sheaf.* February 1905.

•Photographic Postcard. "St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Rugby, N.D. I Helped to Pay the Debt on This Church." Undated. Location: photocopy in SHPO files.

•Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, Rugby, North Dakota. September 1926.

•NDCRS Architectural Site Form. #32 PI 531. SHPO files. (Site form for the church.)

•Cornerstone, "St. Paul's Church. AD 1903."

•Gemini Research. The Rugby Historic Sites Inventory Project. North Dakota Cultural Resources Survey. Final Report 1987-1988. Location: SHPO files.

•*Journal of the 16th Annual Convocation of the Missionary District of North Dakota...May 23, 30, and 31 AD 1903.* Fargo: [the Convocation], 1903.

•Tofsrud, O.T. *Fifty Years in Pierce County.* Privately printed, 1943.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

National Register of Historic Places

Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce County, ND

Section number 10. Geographical Data Page 10

Verbal Boundary Description

St. Paul's Episcopal Church occupies lots 7-9, block 13, in the Original Town Plat of Rugby, North Dakota.

Boundary Justification

The boundary includes those lots which have historically been part of St. Paul's Episcopal Church.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Pierce Co., ND

Section number PHOTOGRAPHS Page 11

- Photographer for all views: BJB Long
- Location of negatives for all views: State Historical Society of North Dakota, Division of Archeology and Historic Preservation
- Date of photographs for all views: July 1991
- Note: tree cover made it difficult to photograph the building

ST. PAUL'S EPISCOPAL CHURCH, Pierce County, ND:

1. North and east facades showing vestibule or side porch (view to SW)
2. Main or east facade (view to west)
3. East and south facades showing uneven site, basement level windows, fieldstone retaining wall (view to NW)
4. West or rear facade (view to east)