### National Register of Historic Places **Registration** Form

and the second se		<u> </u>	Commercial Sector
	& 1995		

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. Sas Districtions in How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item of marking x" in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "WAL" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer, to complete all items. 1. Name of Property SAINT JOHN'S PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH historic name N/A other names/site number \_\_\_\_\_ 2. Location street & number 25 Lake Street and 201 Arguello Boulevard city or town <u>San Francisco</u> \_\_\_\_ I vicinity N/A state California \_ code <u>CA</u> county <u>San Francisco</u> code <u>075</u> zip code <u>94118</u> 3. State/Federal Agency Certification As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended, I hereby certify that this 😾 nomination request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property x meets does not meet the National Register criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant rationally a statewide a locally. ( See continuation sheet for additional comments.) Deputy SHPS (1) heyte IMM Signature of certifying official/Title Date California Office of Historic Preservation State of Federal agency and bureau In my opinion, the property 
meets 
does not meet the National Register criteria. (
See continuation sheet for additional comments.) Date

Signature of commenting official/Title

State or Federal agency and bureau

National Park Service Certification 4.

I hereby certify that the property is: If entered in the National Register. See continuation sheet. determined eligible for the National Register See continuation sheet. determined not eligible for the National Register. al

removed	from	the	Nationa
Registe	ar.		

other. (explain:)

Signature of the Keepe Date of Action Entered in the National Register

Saint John's Presbyterian Church Name of Property San Francisco, California County and State

1

Ownership of Property (Check as many boxes as apply)	Category of Property (Check only one box)	Number of Reso (Do not include previ	ources within Prope ously listed resources in	r <b>ty</b> he count.)
X private	X building(s)	Contributing	Noncontributing	
public-local public-State	☐ district □ site	1	0	buildings
Dublic-State		0	0	sites
	🗆 object	0	00	structure
		2 (notion	boards <b>0</b> 0	objects
		3	0	Total
Name of related multiple p (Enter "N/A" if property is not part	roperty listing of a multiple property listing.)	Number of cont in the National I	ributing resources p Register	reviously listed
N/A		N/A		
6. Function or Use				
Historic Functions (Enter categories from instructions)		Current Functions (Enter categories from in	nstructions)	
Religion/Religious Fa	acility	Religion/Religious Facility		
·		_Education/Sch	ool (non-religio	us)
				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
7. Description				
Architectural Classification (Enter categories from instructions)		Materials (Enter categories from ir	Instructions)	
Late Victorien/Shingle Style		foundationStucco	•	
		walls <u>Wood: Shi</u> i		
			therboard (addit	ion)
		roofAsp	halt_Shingles	
		other		

SEE ATTACHED

.

8. Statement of Significance

**Applicable National Register Criteria** 

County and State

•

Areas	of	Significance	

(Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing.)

- A Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- B Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- **C** Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.
- D Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

#### **Criteria Considerations** (Mark "x" in all the boxes that apply.)

Property is:

- X A owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.
- B removed from its original location.
- $\Box$  C a birthplace or grave.
- **D** a cemetery.
- **E** a reconstructed building, object, or structure.
- **F** a commemorative property.
- G less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.

#### Narrative Statement of Significance

(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

9. Major Bibliographical References SER ATT.	ACHED	
--	-------	--

### Bibliography

(Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more continuation sheets.)

### Previous documentation on file (NPS):

- preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
- previously listed in the National Register
- previously determined eligible by the National Register
- designated a National Historic Landmark
- recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey #\_
- recorded by Historic American Engineering Record # \_\_\_\_\_

### Primary location of additional data:

- □ State Historic Preservation Office
- □ Other State agency
- □ Federal agency
- X Local government
- University
- □ Other

Name of repository:

San Francisco Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board

**Period of Significance** 

1905

**Significant Dates** 

N/A

.

Significant Person (Complete if Criterion B is marked above)

**Cultural Affiliation** 

N/A

.

Architect/Builder

Dodge & Dolliver

# (Enter categories from instructions)

Architecture

### 10. Geographicai Data

### Acreage of Property Less than one acre.

#### **UTM References**

(Place additional UTM references on a continuation sheet.)

1 <u>1</u> 1	541761810	4182 0180
Zone	Easting	Northing
2		

### **Verbal Boundary Description**

(Describe the boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet.)

Saint John's Presbyterian Church occupies all of Lot 1 in Assessor's Block 1361. See Sketch Map.

Easting

□ See continuation sheet

Northing

3

4

#### **Boundary Justification**

(Explain why the boundaries were selected on a continuation sheet.) These are the legally recorded boundaries.

11. Form Prepared By	
name/title <u>Mrs. Bland Platt. Historic Preservation Con</u>	sultant
organization <u>G. Bland Platt Associates</u>	date 28, 1995
street & number <u>362 Ewing Terrace</u>	telephone (415) 922 - 3579
city or town <u>San Francisco</u> state	<u>Ca.</u> zip code <u>94118</u>
Additional Documentation	
Submit the following items with the completed form:	
Continuation Sheets - 25	
Maps	
A USGS map (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's	location.
A Sketch map for historic districts and properties having large	acreage or numerous resources.
Photographs	
Representative black and white photographs of the property.	•
Additional items	
(Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)	
Property Owner	
Complete this item at the request of SHPO or FPO.)	
name <u>Saint John's Presbyterian Church</u>	•••
street & number <u>25 Leke Street</u>	telephone (415) 751-1626
city or town <u>San Francisco</u> state	zip code <u>94118</u>

Paperwork Reduction Act Statement: This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties, and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 470 et seq.).

Estimated Burden Statement: Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18.1 hours per response including time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding this burden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, P.O. Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Projects (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.

14

San Francisco, California County and State

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church

San Francisco, California

Saint John's Presbyterian Church is the equivalent of a 3½ story space, excluding its pyramidal corner steeple, over a partially aboveground basement. Essentially of the Shingle Style, the openings designed to contain its numerous and, generally, earlier stained glass windows are Gothic in shape while the squared corner steeple tower with entry doors on both Arguello Boulevard and Lake Street, and the smaller, hexagonal, semi-detached tower on the South end of the property recall the Norman and Romanesque. All are clad in painted brown shingles. Roof planes are sheathed in flat black asphalt shingles. The interior, while true to the simplicity of the Shingle Style, especially in the narthex, is quite Gothic or Early English in detailing and ornament because it was designed to re-create the interior of the Church's first (1866) and second (1889) locations, as required by the donor of the land and building, A. W. Foster, who joined the congregation in 1875, and was a trustee until his death in 1930. Further, most of the interior features, which had been moved from the original two locations, were moved once again and installed in this 1905 adaptation. These include: "The arch spanning the pulpit with inscription ..., the pews, the pulpit furnishings, and the Rose window on the south wall of the Narthex", as well as the Johnson organ which was shipped around the Horn from Boston in 1872, from the original church; the two large stained glass windows on center in each of the cross-gabled walls, dedicated to founding trustee Henry Mayo Newhall and to the church's first pastor, William Anderson Scott, together with six other smaller windows, and much of the interior woodwork from the second location. The church is located on the southwest corner of Arguello Boulevard and Lake Street, and together with a 1925 synagogue on the northwest corner of the same intersection, serves as an entry to this portion of San Francisco's Richmond District which lies to the west, and was just beginning to be settled in 1905. The church is surrounded by late Nineteenth and early Twentieth century residential buildings that are two and three stories high, read as single family homes, but often contain two to three flats (each apartment absorbing an entire floor of a building). Saint John's has a frontage of 74 feet 7½ inches on Arguello Boulevard and 135 feet on Lake Street. With the exception of the steeple tower and entry steps which come to the property line, the remainder of the building is set back approximately ten (10) feet which provides a planting area and grass along the Lake Street frontage, and areas to contain free-standing Arts and Crafts notice boards. Street trees on both street frontages complete the landscaping. As shown on the appended Plat and Sanborn maps, the westerly 50 feet of the lot extends to the south an additional 27½ feet, essentially absorbing what would have been the rear yard of the neighboring building facing Arguello. In this space in 1913, the

1

United States Department of the interior National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

church added a one-story Sunday School addition; in 1949, an additional story was added. This addition, which is only partially visible from a narrow passage along the southerly end of the building is in keeping with the style and character of the original building which is well-maintained, in excellent condition, and little altered over its 90 years. A ramp installed in 1987 to provide handicapped accessibility via the Lake Street entry door is visually unobtrusive, in part because the metal railings have been painted brown to match the building.

Saint John's Presbyterian Church is rectangular in plan with a steeply-pitched cross-gabled roof system. (Photo 1) The rectangle is augmented by a square, castellated steeple tower, with pyramidal steeple recessed and projecting above, which incorporates two entrances, one on the East and one on the North face. Providing architectural balance and interest is the purely ornamental hexagonal tower (Photo 2), approximately two stories tall, on the South end of the building. Vergeboards protecting the cross-gables are simple, projecting slightly forward and above the roof plane; of particular interest here is that approximately one-third of the distance down from the peak, the vergeboard suddenly juts out at a right angle for a brief moment before returning to the otherwise expected slope at approximately a 45 degree angle. On the Arguello facade, the vergeboard ends its normal downward path with a sweep to the south to join the hexagonal tower. This steeply-pitched gable, just barely visible behind the trees in Photo 3, recessed slightly and to different degrees from both towers, is a prominent feature on this facade and incorporates the 1905 A.W. Foster commemorative stained glass window which is enframed in a recessed Gothic-styled flattened-arched wood surround with rounded, projecting foliated finial above. Directly above the finial, centered in the steepest portion of the gable is the outline of an extremely narrow lancet window that appears to have always been simply decorative.

The square steeple tower was designed to be the focal point of the building and includes the two rather massive entrances to the church. Its placement at the intersection of what are now two busy streets was designed to encourage one and all to enter while its height guaranteed that it would be visible from a distance. At the base of the tower and projecting from the 90-degree angled joining of the wall planes are rectilinear outside buttresses with slanted, layered coping that rise the equivalent of one story. Gabled moldings attached to the tower buttresses add visual interest, and could incorporate signage in the same way that the one at the Northeast corner of the building does. See

7

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Piaces Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

Photo 4. Between the buttresses, on the East and North faces of the tower, are the massive, recessed entry doors, each of which is paired and reached by a short, shallow set of stairs, varying in width and depth to accomodate the slopes of the hill on either side. The shape of the flattened arched drip mold over each door recalls the shaping of the Foster Window surround; here, too, the arch breaks at center, and rises slightly to act as a base for a finial of the same foliated design as seen above the Foster Window. These moldings accentuate the top of each door arch and only extend to slightly below the completion of the arch; the termination at each end is a smaller variation of the same foliate design.

About mid-way up at approximately the second story level, on each face of the tower, there is a pair of very long and very narrow recessed window openings. (Photo 5) Above that, and just below the castellated parapet, on both faces, molding outlines the area once given over to a trio of connected arched windows which can be seen in the photograph on the cover of the Fiftieth Anniversary Bulletin (1920), appended as Photo H-6. This photograph also shows layers of banding at the base, and again, in two finer rows near the pinnacle of the steeple which are no longer there, nor is the triangular framed vent. The 1920 photograph further shows that there once was a small flying buttress that connected the flanged portion of the sloping roof to the hexagonal tower which, itself, appears to have had a segmented parapet similar to the steeple tower, beneath which were a number of long, thin windows, again similar to those in the steeple tower. When these features were eliminated and why is not known; no one in the congregation today remembers these features ever being present, and none of the permits refers to any of this work. One might surmise that removals were related to the continued costs of maintenance and repair. While these features once provided additional visual interest, their loss does not in any way detract from the strength and integrity of the whole as a compelling piece of architecture.

The Lake Street facade is approximately 100 feet long (Photo 7), excluding the tower at the corner. It reads as three distinct but related elements of a highly integrated whole with the cross gable segment projecting forward, and containing the tripartite Gothic Newhall Window dating to 1889. The pitch of the cross gable's roof is as steep as the gable on the front of the church, but the vergeboard here does not extend beyond the roof into the building wall. Six buttresses of the same height and design assist in breaking up the massing and leading the eye upward. The bay lying West of the steeple tower and East of the

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_4 \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco. California

Newhall Window cross gable is divided into two parts by a buttress. Centered, on either side, is a modified Tudor arched stained glass window; directly above each and set within the roof is a deeply recessed smaller, double hung window of the same frame design, protected by a steeply pitched gable hood. The portion of the building to the West of the cross gable is larger and assymmetrical. The most easterly portion replicates that on the other side, but only contains a single Tudor arched window with hooded gable above between two buttresses. The major difference here is that the above-ground basement is high enough due to the downward (westward) slope of the hill, to permit an entry to the basement level. The wood-framed door panels are inset with glass, and the entry is protected by a projecting heavy timbered hood. The remaining two-thirds of this section is balanced in that the four windows are placed two over two; however, all four are different sizes. With the exception of the Tudor arched stained glass window in the upper left, the remaining three windows within the two-story shingled wall are double-hung; below, in the above-ground basement, there is a linear tripartite window. As at the other building corners, there is a buttress at right angles to the corner of the building. Here, it is stuccoed to the height of the above ground basement and shingled above with the slanted coping and gable ornament.

Running the length of the Lake Street frontage, and approximately a foot wide is a stuccoed drainage channel painted to match the aboveground stuccoed basement. Because it jogs around each buttress, its shape is very interesting. It appears to be an original feature, and is not called but in the various permits dealing with termite damage and dry rot. Inward of the channel is a planting bed about two feet wide that contains miniature boxwood plants, widely spaced, and not historic. At the easterly end, near the entrance, there is a free-standing Arts and Crafts notice board; a similarly-designed, but larger one sits within the recess, near the South end of the building, on Arguello Boulevard. (Photo 8) The remainder of the ground to the sidewalk is planted in grass.

The West facade is utilitarian, containing a mixture of window styles randomly placed. A three-foot wide walkway, running North/South, along the building here, leads to a portion of the 1913 and 1949 addition. A wooden stair leads to the church offices on the second floor with the lower floor being accessed by a simple wood door with glass inset in the upper half.

l

**United States Department of the Interior** National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco. California

The South facade is difficult to appreciate because of the narrow passage leading West to the rear of the lot. (Photo 9) Generally speaking, it mirrors the Lake Street facade. One exception is the massive South Porch, just beyond the hexagonal tower which provides access to the Narthex. Its design recalls the entry to the basement from Lake Street, although the hood does not appear to project as far; it is, however, far more majestic in its ornamentation. The cross gable here contains the 1886 William Anderson Scott window. Hooded gable windows precisely mirror those on Lake Street. At the end of the walkway, one can access both levels of the addition which is only visible here and is clad in horizontal wood siding painted brown to match the church.

### INTERIOR

Entering the church through either main entry door places one in a square room, the base of the steeple. In addition to the entry doors, there are two others: one on the West wall leads to the Sanctuary while the one on the South provides entry to the Narthex. Both are identical, mahogany, and match the shape of the entry doors, but are smaller in size. Two small Tudor arched stained glass windows light the space: one is on the West wall near the northwest corner; the other is on the South wall near the Southeast corner. While these are also exterior features, they are not easily accessible or visible from outside. Finely patterned mahogany wainscotting provides a unifying effect with plaster walls above continuing into the vaulted ceiling where four (4) rib vaults join; the juncture is covered with a brass plate from which hangs a half ball crystal and brass pendant fixture.

Entering the Narthex, one is aware of the continuation of the wainscotting along the East wall. On the West, the Narthex is separated from the sanctuary by a mahogany screen approximately eight (8) feet tall which was used in the earlier locations. (Photo 10) The central sections of each panel are latched, hinged and fully operable, allowing expansion of the Sanctuary as needed. The screen incorporates a Tudor arched door leading to the center aisle of the Sanctuary; there are three (3) screen panels to the North of the door and five (5) to the South. Centered on the East wall of the Narthex is the very large Foster Window, a 1905 gift from Arthur W. Foster, who donated the land and the money to build the present church. (Photo 11) The window is dedicated to his parents, William and Mary Foster. During the 1906 Earthquake, this window reportedly fell out onto Lake Street, but was soon repaired and reinstalled. This window is back-lighted at night.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 6 Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

A more complete description of the Foster Window and each of the others is appended as Attachment A (two pages) and includes a diagram prepared by the church showing the location of each; the diagram has been augmented to indicate the approximate age of each window. Continuation of the window's framing members into the plaster above creates a halftimbered effect.

The focal point of the South wall of the Narthex is the Rose Window (Photo 12) which was part of the original 1866 church; in that location and the subsequent church, it was situated above a gallery which was not re-created in this edifice. As one approaches the South end of the Narthex, a short flight of steps leads down to the South Porch door with the Rose Window above. The landing runs the width of the Narthex and leads to another stair to the basement.

Upon entering the Sanctuary, one's eye is immediately drawn to the soaring, open double Nave arcade with transverse arches that span the side aisles. See Photos 13 through 17. From the screen to the transcept, the arcade is composed of four (4) arches running East/West, connecting to three (3) transverse arches and carrying down to the floor in a series of clustered piers which are annulated in the Early English Style, as are the colonettes along the side walls. Each pier incorporates a brass plate and armature from which hang small, fluted lamp globes that are in keeping with the character of the architecture, but are contemporary. The structural complexity created by the arch system joining the steeply pitched roof is accentuated by the effect of the interior void of the outwardly projecting paired gable windows. In the open areas between the roof and the shoulders of the arches, there are three (3) panels on each side, each cut to a different size, and headed with a shouldered foil, and appropriately pierced.

The pews are a very important architectural feature. They date to 1866, and have moved each time with the congregation. As shown in Photo 18, they, too, are in the Early English Style. Several rows of pews are forward of the arcaded side aisles in the transcept. For the most part, however, the transcept is open allowing unobstructed views of the Newhall Window on the North and the Scott Window on the South, both of which date to 1889, and the second church.

The Newhall Window (Photo 19) is dedicated to the memory of Henry Mayo Newhall (May 23, 1825 - March 13, 1882), who arrived in San Francisco in 1850, and after a disastrous experience in the Mother Lode returned to San Francisco, where his previous experience as an

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>7</u> Page <u>7</u> Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

auctioneer proved to be a marketable skill. Within two years, he had acquired the auction house, which continued to be the mainstay of his financial empire until his death. He soon became intrigued by railroading, and with several partners, accumulated real estate for a right-of-way for the San Francisco & San Jose Railroad, connecting the two cities, which was an immediate success. When he was prevented from expanding his system to Sacramento and other points by the Big Four, owners of the Union Pacific, he purchased a major Spanish Land Grant in Southern California where he established the town of Newhall, and what is today known as Newhall Land and Farming Company. During this expansive period, he remained a San Francisco resident. A member of Calvary Presbyterian Church from its inception, Newhall became a close friend of its first pastor, William Anderson Scott, and aided Scott in a number of educational and philanthropic endeavors. Scott was forced to leave Calvary and San Francisco in 1861 because of his pro-Confederacy views. In 1869, with the Civil War over, Newhall and others formed Saint John's Presbyterian, and invited Scott to return as Pastor, which he quickly accepted. Newhall was one of the original trustees of Saint John's, and served as a trustee for other of Scott's endeavors as discussed in the Significance section of this application. Because of Newhall's close association with Reverend Scott, it is appropriate that a window in Dr. Scott's memory (he died in 1885) is at the other end of the transcept. (Photo 19A) Both are exquisite Period pieces.

The double Nave arcade with transverse arches is interrupted at the transcept where the four (4) annulated, clustered piers have additional ribs that span the transcept from East to West, while others, projecting at an angle, rise to support the roof, meeting at the apex from which the Arts and Crafts chandelier hangs. The two most westerly piers also support the chancel arch.

Beyond the transcept is the chancel where the side aisles are again accentuated by a continuation of the arcade/transverse arch. However, here it is only one bay deep. As in the nave, the interplay of the structure of the gabled windows provides additional design interest as each plays off the co-joining of the various arch forms with the steeply sloping roof.

The chancel and pulpit are separated from the nave by a semicircular dais layered in progressively smaller circumferences, thus providing a semi-circular set of four low steps up. (Photo 20) As can be seen from Photographs H-21 through H-23, which show the interiors of all three of Saint John's churches, the chancel and pulpit furnishings

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_8 \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

are nearly identical, including the two side chairs, which, today, are on either side of the pulpit area at the back wall. This includes the chancel arch, inscribed "Worthy is the Lamb that was slain to receive honor, glory, and blessing", over which soar a series of higher arches supporting the roof; the choir screen; and the Johnson organ (Photos 24 through 26), which dates to 1872, when it was purchased in Boston and shipped around Cape Horn to San Francisco. Although repaired after the 1906 earthquake and overhauled and/or augmented in 1910, 1941, 1954-1957, and from 1991 to 1995, the Johnson Organ is essentially the same acclaimed instrument. As part of the 1950's reworking of the organ, according to the October 9, 1956 permit, a "5 foot by 7 foot by 10 foot recess was cut in the choir loft floor to recess console of new organ" equipment; because the choir loft is elevated and screened, this change is not evident.

At the rear of the chancel at floor level, and on either side of the pulpit are two diminutive obtuse angle arched doors leading to the church offices which have been considerably remodeled over time.

Referring to the diagram in Attachment A, showing the individual stained glass windows, note that Window 11, the Saint John the Evangelist Window (1870-1889), is in fact in the chapel, which was added in 1949, when the second floor of the southerly addition was constructed. While the chapel is a Period piece, it does not contribute to the architectural character and integrity of the church itself; however, it is not readily visible and can be closed off from the Sanctuary.

Basement rooms are pleasant, but utilitarian, and have been modified over time to serve a variety of uses. Presently, a Montessori School uses the spaces during the week. The lower floor of the southerly addition, beneath the chapel and a pleasant and comfortable meeting room parallel to it, is an auditorium and other smaller meeting rooms, none of which is architecturally significant. A 1959 permit indicates that the auditorium had been damaged by fire, and that the work was to replace damaged millwork, plaster, and flooring, and clean and paint. A 1961 permit noted the removal of a wood floor in the auditorium and its replacement with a concrete floor.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ 9 \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_\_ San Frnacisco, California

The oldest extant church in San Francisco's Richmond District, and the district's only Shingle Style church, Saint John's Presbyterian Church (1905) is the last remaining visual reminder that San Francisco's religious institutions anticipated and participated in the city's westerly expansion in the late Nineteenth and early Twentieth centuries. The church is also the only remaining example in San Francisco of the philanthrophy of A. (Arthur) W. Foster, a member of the congregation from his arrival in San Francisco in 1875 until his death in 1930. Initially, Foster's wealth stemmed from his participation in, and his 1886 acquisition of the brokerage firm of S. B. Wakefield & Co., which he then renamed A. W. Foster & Co. He subsequently amassed vast land holdings in numerous Northern California communities where his activities included cattle ranching, timber production and railroading. Recognizing San Francisco's impending population shift, Foster purchased the land and provided the vast majority of the construction funding for this structure. At the same time, Foster donated the reknowned Foster Memorial Window on the Arguello Boulevard facade in honor of his parents; with the exception of two stained glass windows dating to the 1920's, the other nine (9) stained glass windows, together with most of the interior finishings and furnishings, were brought with the congregation from its two previous locations. In exchange for his financial support, Foster insisted that the congregation be debt-free at the end of each subsequent calendar year, and that the design of the new church (presumably its interior) re-create that of the congregation's original venue as much as possible. To this end, the architectural firm of Dodge & Dolliver was commissioned to design the 1905 church which incorporates all transportable and re-useable materials and furnishings from the congregation's earlier churches. The firm of Dodge (George A.) and Dolliver (J. Walter) was formed October 11, 1902, and was dissolved in 1905-1906. Saint John's Presbyterian Church is the partnership's single most significant contribution to San Francisco's architectural heritage. Highly rated in all applicable architectural surveys, Saint John's Presbyterian Church was designated a Landmark of the City and County of San Francisco ( Landmark Number 83) in 1976, based upon both its historical and architectural significance. It is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under

Criterion C, because architecturally, it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period and method of construction, is the most important work of Dodge & Dolliver, represents the work of numerous master craftsmen from 1864, when the original church was constructed through 1949, when the final addition was made, and represents high artistic values in its construction as well as its finishings and furnishings.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco. California

### HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Saint John's Presbyterian Church was founded March 6, 1870, by a group of parishioners who were anxious for the return to San Francisco of Calvary Presbyterian's first minister, the dynamic and controversial Reverend William Anderson Scott. Reverend Scott had arrived in San Francisco originally on May 7, 1854 to assume the pastorate at Calvary; because of his compelling persona, within two months, "he was able to organize a church, and raise money to buy land and begin construction of a sanctuary". (The First 100 Years ....) Dr. Scott's vociferous challenge from the pulpit to The Committee of Vigilance, beginning in 1856, caused him to be hung in effigy, but led "to the establishment of the first legally definable government the city ... enjoyed". However, he was unable to survive being hung in effigy for the second time, in September 1861, as a result of including Southern Confederacy President Jefferson Davis in his public prayers. Concerned for his and his family's well-being, his parishioners smuggled the Scotts out of San Francisco on a steamer bound for Panama. For the next eight years, he presided at parishes in Birmingham, England and New York City.

"Three weeks to the day after St. John's was organized, it had its sanctuary ... ", the former Saint James Episcopal Church, constructed in 1867, "reflecting a 'high church' gothic architecture", which was located on Post Street between Taylor and Mason Streets, in downtown San Francisco. While, generally, a discussion of a parish's earlier locations, particularly when these do not survive, is inappropriate, in this instance, one must understand the interior and exterior of the previous locations in order to appreciate fully the present building because so much of the 1867 structure was physically moved and reinstalled in the church's 1889 and 1905 edifices. In comparing the exterior of the present church as seen in Photographs 1 through 9, with photographs of the former "'high church' gothic" Saint James Episcopal (Photo 28), note that both have steeply pitched cross-gabled roofs, and steeply pitched gabled hoods over the clerestory windows, and the entrances. Comparing the interiors is considerably more dramatic and requires close study because the two are nearly identical. Photographs H-21 and H-22 show the interior of Saint James while Photograph 13 shows the interior of the present church. The First 100 Years of Saint John's Presbyterian Church, San Francisco notes: "Included in the \$45,000 purchase price were the pews and many of the interior appointments so familiar to successive generations of worshipers including the Gothic arch spanning the pulpit with the inscription 'Worthy is the Lamb that was slain to receive honor, glory and blessing'".

1 .

**United States Department of the Interior** National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_11 \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

While the Rose Window (Photo 12; see also Window 7 in Attachment A) is considered part of the Saint James Episcopal legacy, Windows 2, 4, 5, 8, 9, and 11 were donated and installed in this first Saint John's Church between 1870 and 1889. With the exception of the donors as shown on "The Windows of Saint John's" (Attachment A), there is no information about the windows, such as their designers or creators. Suffice it to say that each is an exquisite Period piece, and all compliments one another with respect to design, and intensity of color.

Another important addition during this period, and still an integral part of the church today is the Johnson Pipe Organ which was installed in 1872. "The organ was purchased for the sum of \$10,000 and brought by sailing ship around Cape Horn from Boston. 30 of the 40 ranks of pipes in the present organ were first heard in 1872...." (The First 100 <u>Years...)</u> In his <u>Memoirs of a San Francisco Organ Builder</u>, Louis J. Schoenstein describes the Saint John's organ more completely: "...and, in 1872, bought a three manual and Pedal Johnson organ of 30 stops, Opus #394 from Westfield, Mass. It had a rich brilliant tone, yet pleasing, as it was voiced on 31/2" wind. The lowest octave of the Great manuel was supplied with a Barker pneumatic lever action to help relieve the heavy tension on the keys." The organ moved with the congregation in 1889 and 1905. Four days after the dedication of the church in its present location, San Francisco suffered a major earthquake on April 18, 1906, during which the organ was damaged by a fallen chimney on the West end of the building. Mr. Schoenstein recalls: "What a sight we beheld ... brick and mortar all over the organ, trackers, squares, roller boards broken, and pipes crushed.... I recall it was a matter of several weeks before the organ was again in first class working order." Mr. Schoenstein notes that some "improvements" were made to the organ in 1910 and 1941, to improve its capabilities; in 1954-1957, the organ was "modernized" while retaining "the beautiful and massive black walnut case", "the slide and pallet chests and all of the old pipes which were still in excellent condition...." Similar updating and repair was undertaken between 1991 - 1995.

Because Doctor Scott had died in 1885, well before the present church was constructed, regulations prevent his being considered an associated historical personage with respect to this nomination. Such a narrow interpretation in this case is unfortunate, however, because the congregation probably would not have survived to this day without his continuing legacy. For example, Henry Mayo Newhall, a pioneer who arrived in San Francisco in July 1850, and established a noted auction house, became a close friend of Dr. Scott's beginning in 1854. Newhall, for whom the town of Newhall, California is named, and who founded

# National Register of Historic Piaces Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

Newhall Land and Farming Company by joining numerous Spanish Land Grants, helped Dr. Scott escape in 1861, and was responsible for Dr. Scott's return to San Francisco in 1870. According to Newhall's biography, published by his family in 1991, Henry Mayo Newhall and His Times, "... Newhall purchased the Saint James Episcopal Church building for Scott.... He remained president of the Saint John's board of nine trustees from 1870 until his death [1882], dedicating a stained glass window [1889] to mark his support of the church." The most pertinent example, however, is Arthur W. (A. W.) Foster, who, upon his arrival in San Francisco in 1875, immediately joined Saint John's and quickly became a close friend of Dr. Scott's. In 1876, Foster married Scott's daughter Louisiana. Together, the Fosters are responsible for the purchase of the present site and construction of the church which replicates the original sufficiently to satisfy Foster's requirements. The Fosters' descendents still support the church today, and could inherit the site if Saint John's were ever to end a year in debt. Even though the Fosters and the Newhalls, as well as other founding families, eventually resided outside San Francisco, they have continued to support Saint John's as their ancestors had in the 1870's.

In addition to his clerical duties, Scott is remembered in the numerous California histories, which include his biographical information, as the founder, in 1872, of the San Francisco Theological Seminary which was housed at Saint John's until 1877. In 1888, A. W. Foster donated land for the present complex in San Anselmo, California; Scott Library Hall, one of the original two buildings on the campus completed in 1892, contains the nucleus of Dr. Scott's remarkable library. Another of Dr. Scott's passions was the establishment of the first Presbyterian college on the West Coast, which he founded in 1859. Named City College (no relationship to San Francisco's present City College), the institution floundered in the 1860's during Dr. Scott's absence; upon his return, Dr. Scott and others attempted to revive the institution, but in 1879, they were forced to concede defeat due to financial insolvency. Scott is also remembered as the minister who married Robert Louis Stevenson and Fannie Osbourne "at my residence 19th May 1880", according to his Record of Marriages.

Dr. Scott's death in 1885 marked the beginning of a difficult time for Saint John's as the congregation searched for a stimulating replacement for their beloved pastor. Participation may have been dwindling by 1887, when the April 10th minutes indicate: "The Session, Trustees and people have for some time past believed that the interests of the Church would be advanced by their removal to a new field in the Western part of the City...." By May 8, 1889, the parish minutes

11

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

> indicate that a new church had been secured at California and Octavia Streets, in San Francisco's Western Addition, which is today considered Pacific Heights; dedication services were held on July 7, 1889. An examination of Photograph 28 shows both differences and similarities between the exterior of the original edifice and the present one. However, comparing Photo 13 of the interior of this church to the old or to the present shows few modifications because the congregation again took everything with them. According to <u>The First 100 Years ...</u>: "With but one major change, the broadening of the transcept arch at the front of the church, the interior of the edifice remained the same, the pews, Johnson Organ and pulpit furniture continued in service. The broadening of the transcept arch provided room for the installation of the large Scott and Newhall stained glass windows, which we still enjoy today." Parish records are silent on the architect/builder for this structure which no longer remains.

> As noted in the above quotation, two notable stained glass windows were added as part of the construction. Seemingly equally sized and larger than any of their predecessors, the two windows face one another on either side of the transcept, as they do in the Saint John's of today. The Scott Window (Window 10 - Attachment A) is visible in Photograph H-23, showing the interior of the 1889 church. Photograph 19A is a 1995 shot of the same window. The Scott Window is inscribed: "In Memoriam, William Anderson Scott, D.D., LL.D, Our Beloved Pastor and Founder of this Church. Died Jan. 14, 1885." Because of Newhall's long association with Saint John's, and his deep and abiding friendship with Dr. Scott, it is appropriate that the Newhall and Scott Windows face one another in the transcept. The Newhall Window is Number 13 in Attachment A; Photograph 19 shows this same window in 1995. Again, unfortunately, church records do not provide information on the designer or creator of either of these important windows.

> By 1900, the congregation was again experiencing financial hardship which was remedied by allowing Dr. Scott's original parish, Calvary, to use Saint John's while their new church was being constructed approximately two miles to the West. In exchange for the privilege, Calvary, which had just sold its land for the construction of the Saint Francis Hotel on Union Square, paid off Saint John's mortgage and accumulated debts. A year and a half later, when the new Calvary was completed, Saint John's parishioners seriously considered disbanding and joining Calvary.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 14 Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

### ARTHUR V. (A. V.) FOSTER

In 1902, word of Saint John's possible demise reached A. W. Foster. "President of the California Northwestern Railway, developer of the San Francisco waterfront, owner of vast expanses of real estate in the city, the Sonoma Valley, and the north coast counties, A. W. Foster was one of California's wealthiest men.... He was (a) Regent of the University of California, a patron of the arts, a sponsor of the agricultural and horticultural research of Luther Burbank. In 1910, he was selected by Andrew Carnegie as one of the trustees of the Carnegie Foundation for International Peace. He was a director of the Market Street Railroad Company, and in 1915 was a director and treasurer of the Panama Pacific International Exposition." (The First 100 Years...)

Foster's reaction to the possible merger was: "One day there will not be so much as a vacant square foot of land on the San Francisco peninsula, and thus, it is folly to advocate a reduction in the number of churches, rather we should be building throughout the City until every neighborhood is served." He urged the congregation to go "as missionaries" to "some new part of the City", and issued the following challenge: "If 50 people will give positive leadership, seek out a new site for the Church, and move, I will pay off all debts, repay our rightful obligations to Calvary Church, buy the needed land, build a church as beautiful as the one I remember so well a quarter of a century ago, and guarantee the pastor's salary. All I ask is that at each annual meeting of the Church the treasurer is able to report the Church is debt free...."

The land selected by Foster and the congregation was located in San Francisco's sparsely settled Richmond District, approximately three miles from the California/Octavia location, and described as "the sand dunes north of the Park [Golden Gate], south of the Presidio, west of the cemeteries, east of the racetrack". The 1906 San Francisco Block Book shows A. W. Foster as the owner of the parcel which is precisely the same size and shape it is today: with a 135 foot frontage on Lake Street (North) and 74 feet 7% inches on Arguello Boulevard (East), the westerly property line is 102 feet 1½ inches long while the southerly property line is irregular in that it "doglegs" around a residential parcel that has a 27½ foot frontage on Arguello and a depth of 85 feet. Because the 1906 Earthquake damaged most land records, it is unknown precisely when Foster assembled the parcel. By comparing the Plat Maps from 1901 and 1906, it is clear that Foster purchased two lots on Arguello and a 50 foot portion of Joseph Nash's previously unsubdivided 125 foot frontage on Lake Street. One would assume this took place

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 15 Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

1903-1904, in order to give the architects time to design the structure prior to the April 25, 1905 groundbreaking services.

Although church records are silent on selection of the architectural firm, one could assume that Foster made this determination since he was paying their fees, together with construction costs, and because he was determined that the new structure replicate the original. Why he selected the architectural firm of Dodge & Dolliver is also unknown as is any earlier connection he may have had with either man.

### DODGE & DOLLIVER

The association of George A. Dodge and J. W. (Walter) Dolliver was a brief one. Their partnership was announced in the San Francisco Chronicle on October 11, 1902, and was dissolved prior to publication of the 1906 San Francisco City Directory. Little is known about Dodge who was born in San Francisco and died in an automobile accident on July 31, 1919. Prior to his association with Dolliver, he was a draftsman in the offices of pioneer architect Moses J. Lyon. He received his license to practice architecture on September 21, 1901, when he was granted Certificate Number A175. A resident of Corte Madera (Marin County) from 1902-03 until 1907, Dodge again became a San Francisco resident, and formed a partnership with Glenn Allen in 1907. It is interesting to note that one of Dodge & Allen's first commissions in 1907 was a pair of flats for Joseph Nash, at 35-37 Lake Street, bordering and just West of Saint John's. Several years prior to his death, Dodge had ceased being a practicing architect in order to "assist in the management of the San Francisco Materials Exhibit". His obituaries cite his participation in the County'Court House at Redwood City, California, and his design of the Odd Fellows Hall in San Francisco.

J. W. Dolliver was born in Boston in 1868, where he received his architectural training. He later worked in Milwaukee, Wisconsin before coming to San Francisco where he worked as a draftsman for The Reid Brothers. He received his California architectural license on September 16, 1901 (A-125), and began his practice with Dodge the following month. A San Francisco resident through 1903, Dolliver moved to Ross (Marin County) by 1907, although he retained a San Francisco office until his death in 1927. In addition to the two buildings mentioned with respect to Dodge, Dolliver designed the Sonoma County Court House, widely proclaimed in 1907; the Sheriff's Office and Jail in Santa Rosa (1912); the Tamalpais Union High School; and numerous residences. According to architectural historian Gary A. Goss, Dolliver was well-known for his shingle work. He was selected to enter a competition to design a

2 A

**United States Department of the Interior** National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_6 \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

Masonic Home in Alameda County in 1921, but did not prevail. He also designed the headquarters building for the Marin Municipal Water District in San Rafael some time after its establishment in 1912, at which time A. W. Foster was President.

While they were associated, Dodge & Dolliver designed four (4) residences in the general vicinity of Saint John's, the most well-known being a 1904 residence for reknowned photographer Ansel Adams' father. Also in 1904, the firm was asked to design a building for the San Francisco Theological Society that probably was not built, but in any case is not extant. Two additional residences, one on Russian Hill (1902) and one in Pacific Heights (1904) complete the list of known projects. Clearly, Saint John's is the only church designed by the partnership, but it is also their most creative commission, combining, as it does, the Gothic with the Romanesque in a 1905 adaptation of the Shingle Style, so prevalent in San Francisco from the 1890's forward.

CONSTRUCTION OF SAINT JOHN'S IN THE RICHMOND DISTRICT - 1905-1907

Following the April 25, 1905 groundbreaking, construction began in earnest. On February 8, 1906, Louisiana Scott Foster laid the cornerstone. By this time, most of the building had been completed, and the congregation was using the basement for services. On April 14, 1906, the sanctuary was complete, enabling the congregation to hold its first service there.

That the new church met all of A. W. Foster's requirements can be seen by comparing Photos H-21 and H-22 of the interior of the original church and Photo H-23 of the interior of the California and Octavia location to the interior of the present building (Photograph 13). Seating in the side aisles or galleries was eliminated in the new construction, thereby truncating the width of the sanctuary somewhat while creating a more intimate space with side aisles. A single chandelier in the Arts and Crafts style, centered in the transcept, replaced a series of pendent fixtures suspended over the center aisle. The most dramatic difference was the addition of the Elijah or Foster Window in the Warthex (East wall), which A. W. Foster donated in 1905 -1906 to honor the memory of his parents, William and Mary Foster. The largest of the stained glass windows, The Foster Window adds visual interest to the interior while serving as a major architectural feature on the Arguello Boulevard facade. For these reasons, it is clear that Dodge and Dolliver anticipated the donation in designing this facade. Since the late 1960's, the Foster Window has been back lit to enable pedestrians to appreciate its magnificence in the evening. With the

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_7 Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco. California

installation of the Foster Window and the elimination of the galleries, the Rose Window (Window 7 - Photograph 12) was placed on the South wall of the Marthex, above the South entry door.

### THE FOSTER LEGACY

That A.V. Foster and his wife, Louisiana, were generous contributors to numerous causes and institutions is well-documented. Saint John's Presbyterian Church, with which the Fosters remained intimately involved until his death in 1930, and Mrs. Foster's death in 1939, is the only remaining example of their philanthropy in San Francisco, from which Foster ran his vast financial empire on a daily basis from 1875 until shortly before his death. Saint John's is also the most significant known structure in Northern California that is directly connected with the Fosters and their great wealth, amassed between 1875 and the 1920's, when Foster became over-extended and lost "the greater part of his property", which he had used "as collateral for development loans". For example, in 1886, the Fosters had acquired Fairhills, a 113-acre estate in San Rafael (Marin County) with a residence constructed by a previous owner in 1869. That residence and the surrounding gardens were demolished in 1946, when the estate was sold for a subdivision; the only vestiges of the estate are the Gate House and a gazebo. Two of the four houses built as wedding presents for the Fosters daughters remain on the Forbes Avenue perimeter of the estate, but they are surrounded by infill housing related to the 1946 development. Because Foster continued to amass land in the San Rafael area, he was often asked to contribute land to non-profit institutions. In 1890, Foster donated land for the establishment of the Mount Tamalpais Military Academy, now known as Marin Academy, which his sons later attended; the 1871 O'Connor residence on the property was re-named Foster Hall. In 1922, he leased land to the San Rafael Improvement Club, which he later donated; the Victrola Pavilion from the 1915 Panama-Pacific Exposition was floated across the Bay and installed on the site where it remains today. The only recognition of Foster's generosity to the San Francisco Theological Seminary is a large Director's Room created, in the 1960's, within the other original building, Montgomery Hall (1892). From this assessment, it is apparent that the 1905 Saint John's Presbyterian Church is the most architecturally and historically significant remaining example of Mr. and Mrs. Foster's many contributions to the historic development of Northern California.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>8</u> Page <u>18</u> Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

#### **1906 BARTHQUAKE**

Four days after the first service was held in the sanctuary, on April 18, 1906, San Francisco experienced its most disastrous earthquake. Because of its location in the westerly portion of the city, Saint John's was not threatened by the fires that ravaged the downtown. On the whole, damage to the building was relatively minor. As discussed above, a brick chimney on the West wall of the structure fell into the sanctuary, damaging the organ. At the same time, the Foster Window fell out into the street. While there may have been other, more minor effects, none has been specifically chronicled in the Session Minutes, although it was noted that: "It was the better part of a year" before the sanctuary could be used again for services. In the meantime, services were once again held in the basement auditorium.

Although the sanctuary was not ready for occupancy until the Spring of 1906, the basement space had been in use for Sunday School "the last part of [1905]". Gradually, other functions had been moved to the building with provisions being made that: "A pew be set aside for the nurses from Children's Hospital, also for soldiers from the Presidio." Consequently, Saint John's was a recognized presence in the sparsely populated area before the Earthquake, and it was to the church that many came for assistance following the Earthquake: "The church building began its notable career as a center for social service as it ministered to and housed many victims of the holocaust."

Following repairs, Saint John's was formally dedicated on April 28, 1907. As part of that ceremony, A. W. Foster presented the deed to property to the congregation.

### SAINT JOHN'S AND THE RICHMOND DISTRICT BUILDING BOOM

At the turn of the century, Presidio Heights, the neighborhood just East of Arguello Boulevard, and the Richmond District to the West were sparsely populated, but interest in both area was growing. Lot sizes in Presidio Heights were and are, in general, substantially larger than those in areas of the city that were settled in the last half of the Nineteenth Century; consequently, these lots appealed to those who could afford to build a large, detached single family home or mansion, although the area also contains a substantial number of two and three flat buildings. The Richmond District, on the other hand, is comprised of lots not much wider than the standard 25-foot frontage found elsewhere in the city.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

Migration to both of these neighborhoods accelerated immediately following the Earthquake when many had lost their residences in the easterly part of the city. Developers and other property owners seized the opportunity to provide housing, and in the case of the Richmond District, affordable housing, opportunities for young families. Saint John's was ideally situated in the midst of these two neighborhoods to become the focal point for the social and educational, as well as religious, life of the new residents. It was also the only church in the immediate area which increased its desirability.

#### COMPARATIVE AWALYSIS OF SAINT JOHN'S

It is interesting to note that at the time Saint John's was constructed, there were only two congregations established in the Inner Richmond, one Episcopalian (1890-91), and one Methodist (1897); both sufficiently distant to make them less convenient and desirable. Both congregations are still extant, but their churches date to the 1920's, making Saint John's the oldest extant church in the Richmond District. Citywide, Saint John's is one of five (5) wood-framed, shingled churches remaining. Of these, only one other, Saint Mary the Virgin Episcopal Church in Pacific Heights, would be considered to be of the Shingle Style. And there, the comparison stops for Saint Mary's is a low-rise cottage-like church surrounded by greenery and dating to 1891, while Saint John's soars above its urban setting, and reflects its own time and place with some Arts and Crafts detailing incorporated into the Gothic, Norman and Romanesque aspects of the Shingle Style.

### ADDITIONS AND ALTERATIONS

Because of the migration, particularly of young families, to the area, Saint John's Sunday School quickly outgrew its alloted facilities. According to <u>The First 100 Years</u> ..., "Undaunted, parishioners, in a doit-yourself effort, led by contractors Alexander Wagstaff and John C. McLean, replaced a woodshed with a 25 by 50 foot 'Primary Building' or 'Annex' 'just across the alley', which was to house generations of youngsters during the years 1913 to 1950." According to the 1913 permit, and verified by the <u>1913 San Francisco City Directory</u>, Wagstaff was an architect, working as a draftsman in a neighborhood architectural firm; he listed himself as the architect on the permit. The same City Directory lists Mr. McLean as a contractor, but the building permit shows James Gilchrist as the Builder. The Building Permit stipulates that the one-story room will be 11 to 15 feet high, and will be 50 feet long on the North/South dimension, and 27.5 feet long on the East/West dimension. It was to have a tar and gravel roof, a concrete foundation

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

and be sheathed in rustic on three sides. The sketch on the permit shows the addition to be free-standing, and accessible from the alleys on the West and South of the Church; it occupies the space that might once have been the rear yard for the residence directly to the West of the Church.

In 1920, the final two stained glass windows were incorporated "into the two ends of the choir loft" which had been "quite dark". These are shown on Attachment A as Windows 1 and 12. The only surviving information about these windows is that they were both donated by John H. and Flora B. Kemp.

From 1944 to 1949, parishioners commissioned a number of feasibility studies related to expanding their facilities. During this time, \$30,000 was raised for the as yet undetermined construction that would include what is now called the Redwood Chapel. By the time a plan had been agreed upon, the cost of the proposed construction had increased considerably, requiring additional fundraising. According to The First 100 Years ..., "on September 28, 1949, the Chapel was dedicated". Whether the Chapel was completed at the time of its dedication is questionable since a building permit application was not filed until July 19, 1949, and was not approved until September 20th, although a note suggests issuance on September 14th. The work to be done according to the permit was: "Add second story to existing one story building consisting of chapel and reception room". The architect was Ward Thomas and the structural engineers were Washington & Spitzer; no contractor had as yet been selected. The 1949 work resulted in bringing the addition forward on the North so that the addition could be incorporated into and be accessible from the church itself, as it is today. As a result of the chapel addition, The Saint John the Evangelist Window (Window 11 on Attachment A), which dates to the 1870 - 1889 period and the original site, was moved from its location on the South wall of the Sanctuary into the new Chapel.

The addition was skillfully handled: when viewed from Lake Street, looking South down the alleyway, it is difficult to imagine that the newer portion was not constructed in 1905; when the two-story addition is viewed from the alleyway to the South of the church, it is impossible to discern that it was constructed at two distinctly different times, 36 years apart. While the addition is clearly more contemporary stylistically than the church, and is clad in rustic siding, painted to match the shingles, rather than in shingles, visually it appears to be timeless, and highly appropriate. For these reasons, coupled with the

### National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

fact that it is set back so far from the street, the addition does not impact the integrity of the church itself.

Apparently, there was a fire in the lower floor of the addition, which contains the auditorium, in late 1958 or early 1959, because there is a March 1959 permit to repair fire damage here. The permit specifies that the work will match existing materials.

Most of the subsequent permits are for maintenance and repair of termite damage or dry rot. An April, 1962 permit to repair wood shingles, and paint the exterior included some sheet metal work. Although there is no information on the permit to confirm the following, this work could have resulted in the change in shingle patterning on the steeple, the enclosure of windows in the steeple tower, and the removal of the small flying butress that once connected the flanged portion of the sloping roof to the hexagonal, decorative tower on the South end of the building. As stated in #7, the features no longer exist, but their removal does not affect the overall integrity of the building.

Also mentioned in the Description is the installation of a handicapped access ramp in the Fall of 1986, as required by codes. As can be seen in Photo 4, this construction tends to fade from view because it is painted to match the church, and because the rails are thin and well separated. All in all, this is a particularly well conceived and executed solution that could serve as an example for others. For these reasons, it also does not affect the architectural integrity of the structure.

#### RECOGNITION IN ARCHITECTURAL SURVEYS

Saint John's Presbyterian Church has been a designated Landmark of the City and County of San Francisco since September 13, 1976. It is known as Landmark Number 83, and was cited in the designating documents for its interior as well as its exterior archtectural significance together with its historical significance, including its associations both with Doctor Scott and A. W. Foster, and the importance of the congregation in the development of the city of San Francisco.

In the Department of City Planning's 1976 City-wide Architectural Inventory, Saint John's received a rating of "4", with "5" being the highest possible grade. A rating of this calibre puts the building in the top 1% of architecturally significant buildings in the entire city. It received the highest marks for its "overall form" and "several unique visual features". It also received notably high marks for its

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>8</u> Page <u>22</u> Saint John's Presbyterian Church <u>San Francisco</u>, California

"Relationship with Surrounding Buildings", especially the "Relationship of Setting to Building" and for its "Importance as a Contribution to a Cluster/Streetscape". Its "Overall Architectural Quality", "Facade Proportions", and "Richness/Excellence or Detailing/Decoration" were also highly rated.

In the early 1990's, The Foundation for San Francisco's Architectural Heritage conducted an in-depth cultural resources survey of the Inner Richmond District. Saint John's received the very highest "A" rating, receiving 86 out of a possible 90 points. Buildings in the survey, which used modified Kalman methodology, were graded based upon architecture, history, integrity and environmental considerations.

While Saint John's Presbyterian Church is mentioned in numerous historical sources, it is featured Patrick McGrew's <u>Landmarks of San</u> <u>Francisco</u>(1991); Willard and Wilson's <u>Sacred Places of San Francisco</u> (1985); and Helton and Leach's <u>Heritage and Hope</u>(1979). These, and other references are more completely set forth in the Bibliography which follows.

01

**United States Department of the Interior** National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church San Francisco, California

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Carrick, Rev. L. R. and McCormack, Rev. P. "The Windows of Saint John's". circa 1956, 2 pages.

Deas, Elder J. Roger. <u>A Condensed History of the First 100 Years of St.</u> John's Presbyterian Church in San Francisco. Founded March 6, 1870. 31 pages.

Drury, Clifford Merrill. <u>William Anderson Scott - No Ordinary Man</u>. Glendale, California: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1967. 352 pages.

Foundation for San Francisco's Architectural Heritage. Architects File: Dodge & Dolliver.

Foundation for San Francisco's Architectural Heritage. Richmond District Survey.

Goss, Gary A., Compiler. Index to The Architect and Engineer Volume 1-95, 1905-1928. San Francisco: California Historical Society, 1982. Page 13.

Goss, Gary A., Interview regarding Dodge and Dolliver, May 15, 1995.

Hart, James D., <u>A Companion to California</u>. New York: Oxford University Press, 1978. Page 394.

Helton, Helen E. and Norman E. Leach. (Editors). <u>Heritage and Hope - A</u> <u>History of the Protestant. Anglican & Orthodox Church Movement in San</u> <u>Francisco</u>.... San Francisco: S.F. Council of Churches, 1979. 336 pages.

LeBaron, Gaye. "This Was a Man Who Knew How to Run a Railroad." Santa Rosa, California <u>Press Democrat</u>, March 28, 1993.

Lowell, Waverly B., Editor, California Cooperative Preservation of Architectural Records. <u>Architectural Records in the San Francisco Bay</u> <u>Area - A Guide to Research.</u> New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1988. Page 267.

McGrew, Patrick. <u>Landmarks of San Francisco</u>. New York: Harry M. Abrams, Inc., 1991. Page 132.

"Memorial Windows", The Architect and Engineer. June, 1908. Page 69.

. 1.

**United States Department of the Interior** National Park Service

### National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_24 \_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

Millard, Bailey. <u>History of the San Francisco Bay Region.</u> San Francisco: The American Historical Society, Inc., 1924. Volume I, page 343-344.

Millard, Bailey. <u>History of the San Francisco Bay Region</u>. San Francisco: The American Historical Society, Inc., 1924. Volume II, page 287-288.

Rolle, Andrew. <u>Henry Mayo Newhall and His Times - A California Legacy.</u> San Marino, California: The Huntington Library, 1991. 168 pages.

Rousselin, Michel. <u>Fairhills - 125 Years of Marin History With a</u> <u>Biography of A.W. Foster.</u> San Rafael, California: F.P.O.A., 1990. 68 pages.

Saint John's Presbyterian Session Minutes (Excerpted 1940.) 1866-1927.

San Francisco Assessor's Office. Sales Ledgers, 1914-1995.

San Francisco Block Books (various) 1901, 1906, and 1909.

San Francisco City Directories (various) 1898-1907.

San Francisco Department of Public Works, Bureau of Building Inspection. Building and alteration permits, 1913-1992; 1949 plan sheet.

San Francisco Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board. Case Report: Saint John's United Presbyterian Church, March 3, 1976. 7 pages.

San Francisco Theological Seminary: Century II-1871-1971-2071. San Francisco: San Francisco Theological Seminary, 1971. Pages 1-8.

San Francisco Water Department. Service Records.

Schoenstein, Louis J., <u>Memoirs of a San Francisco Organ Builder.</u> San Francisco: Cue Publications, 1977. 694 pages.

Snyder, John. "The Building Index of San Francisco - April 1, 1879 to June 20, 1900 - as listed in The California Architect and Building News and its Predecessor Publications", circa 1980.

Starr, Kevin. "The 111 Years of St. John's." San Francisco Examiner, March 28, 1981. Page S18.

Villard, Ruth Hendricks and Carol Green Wilson. <u>Sacred Places of San</u> <u>Francisco.</u> Novato, California: Presidio Press, 1985. Pages 125-127.

.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number \_\_\_\_ Page \_\_\_\_ Saint John's Presbyterian Church \_\_\_\_\_ San Francisco, California

Withey, Henry F., AIA and Elsie Rathburn Withey. <u>Biographical Dictionary</u> of <u>American Architects (Deceased).</u> Los Angeles: New Age Publishing Co., 1956. Pages 177-178.

### PHOTOGRAPHS

With the exception of historic photographs in Saint John's Presbyterian Church's archives, which are designated with an H preceding the number, all photographs were taken in May 1995 by Reverend John S. Anderson, Pastor of the church. The negatives are located in the Church Office at Saint John's.

A description of each photograph will be found on the reverse.

There are a total of 29 photos. There is no photo #27.

