# National Register of Historic Places Registration Form



This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations of eligibility for individual properties or districts. See instructions in *How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Form* (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer to complete all items.

1. Name of Property

historic name Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House
other names/site number
2. Location
street & number 290 E. 500 South N/A not for publication
city or town Gunnison N/A vicinity
state Utah code UT county Sanpete code 039 zip code 84634
3. State/Federal Agency Certification
As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended, I hereby certify that this X nomination _request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property X meets _does not meet the National Register criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant _nationally _statewide X locally. (_ See continuation sheet for additional comments.)  Signature of certifying official/Title
Signature of certifying official/Title Date  State or Federal agency and bureau  4. National Park Service Certification  I hereby certify that this property is:  Date Date Date Date Date Date Date Date
ventered in the National Register. See continuation sheet. determined eligible for the National Register. See continuation sheet. determined not eligible for the National Register. removed from the National Register. other, (explain:)

#### 5. Classification

Ownership of Property (Check as many boxes as apply)	Category of Property (Check only one box)	Number of Res	sources within Pr	<b>operty</b> s in the count.)	
X private	<u>x</u> building(s)	Contributing	Noncontributin	g	
_ public-local	district	1	00	buildings	
_ public-State	_ site	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		sites	
_ public-Federal	structure				
	_ object				
			0		
Name of related multiple pr (Enter "N/A" if property is not part of		Number of cor the National R		ces previously listed in	
N/A		N/A			
6. Function or Use					
Historic Functions (Enter categories from instructions)		Current Functions (Enter categories from instructions)			
DOMESTIC: single dwelling		DOMESTIC: single dwelling			
7. Description					
Architectural Classification (Enter categories from instruc		<b>Materials</b> (E	nter categories fro	m instructions)	
MID-19TH CENTURY		Foundation S	TONE		
Classical		walls	Limestone		
	<del></del>	***************************************	ASPHALT		
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	and and all the state of the st	other		Mary and and the control of the cont	

### **Narrative Description**

(Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

## Gunnison, Sanpete County, Utah City, County, and State

Applic (Mark	atement of Significance cable National Register Criteria "x" on one or more lines for the criteria ing the property for National Register listing.)	Areas of Significance (Enter categories from instructions)			
_ A	Property is associated with events that have	ARCHITECTURE			
	made a significant contribution to the broad				
	patterns of our history.				
В	Property is associated with the lives of persons				
	significant in our past.				
<u>x</u> c	Property embodies the distinctive characteristics				
	of a type, period, or method of construction, or	Period of Significance			
	represents the work of a master, or possesses	c.1883			
	high artistic values, or represents a				
	significant and distinguishable entity whose				
	components lack individual distinction.	Significant Dates			
_ D	Property has yielded, or is likely to yield,	<u>c.1883</u>			
	information important in prehistory or history.	·			
	a Considerations				
(Mark Proper	"x" on all that apply.)	Significant Person (Complete if Criterion B is marked above)			
. A	owned by a religious institution or used for	N/A			
	religious purposes.	Cultural Affiliation			
B	removed from its original location.	N/A			
_c	a birthplace or grave.				
_ D	a cemetery.				
	a reconstructed building, object, or	Architect/Builder			
_ E	- · ·	Unknown/Unknown			
F	a commemorative property.	OTIKITOWI/OTIKITOWIT			
_ G	less than 50 years of age or achieved				
N. I. m. mark	significance within the past 50 years.				
Narrative Statement of Significance (Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)					
		X See continuation sheet(s) for Se	ection No. 8		
9. Ma	jor Bibliographical References				
(Cite the Previous previous (36 mm) previous previous Regular and the previous previ	graphy ne books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form nus documentation on file (NPS): minary determination of individual listing CFR 67) has been requested riously listed in the National Register riously determined eligible by the National ister gnated a National Historic Landmark orded by Historic American Buildings Survey	r on one or more continuation sheets.)  Primary location of additional data:  X State Historic Preservation Office  Other State agency  Federal agency  Local government  University  Other  Name of repository:			
reco	orded by Historic American Engineering ord #				

city or town \_ Ephraim

CITY STREET, N89*W 2.56 C, S1*W 2.70 C, N87*02' E 8 GUNNISON CITY SURVEY
_ See continuation sheet(s) for Section No. 10
e associated with the building.
_ See continuation sheet(s) for Section No. 10
date <u>January 1998</u>
telephone <u>(801) 373-7198</u>
state <u>UT</u> zip code <u>84627</u>
roperty's location. ving large acreage or numerous resources. of the property. nal items.)
telephone (435) 373-7198

Paperwork Reduction Act Statement: This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties, and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 470 et seq.).

state UT zip code 84627

Estimated Burden Statement: Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18.1 hours per response including time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding this burden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, P.O. Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Projects (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 7 Page 1

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

#### **Narrative Description**

The James and Caroline M. Metcalf House, built c.1883 is a small, one-story stone house with an original stone lean-to on the rear. The house underwent both exterior and interior rehabilitation during 1995-97 after years of severe neglect and decline. A small rear addition and a few modern features were introduced during the rehab, but the overall historic form and character-defining features of the house were retained.

The north-facing principal facade is symmetrically composed, with a center door flanked by a pair of windows. Simple wood casings frame the openings, with the top pieces slightly pedimented and extending beyond the side casings in a lintel-like fashion. The exterior walls are locally quarried oolitic limestone, finished to various lengths but trimmed to a uniform height to allow for even courses. The surface of the stones has been tooled to a moderately smooth texture, but it is neither highly finished nor decoratively tooled. The mortar was repointed during the 1995-97 rehab using mortar of a color and texture matching the original as closely as possible. The gable roof features brick chimneys at either end and has a rear shed-roof extension creating a broken saltbox appearance. The entire roof is trimmed by a simple boxed cornice.

The interior of the original house currently has only two rooms, the 12 x 19 main room and the 8 x 10 original rear extension at the southeast corner. Beneath the rear room is a basement or cellar with stone walls. The main room was probably divided originally into two rooms, creating a hall-parlor plan, the most common of nineteenth-century Utah house types.<sup>1</sup>. "Ghost" evidence of a dividing wall to the right of the doorway was discovered during the 1995-97 rehabilitation. It is possible, though not likely, the house was originally a single-cell type, and that the wall was added later, then subsequently removed. Single cells are almost always square rather than rectangular.<sup>2</sup> Therefore, though the dimensions of this house are small, it is much more likely that it was originally a hall-parlor rather than a single cell. Further support for an original two-room, hall-parlor house is the presence of two gable-end chimneys, one for each room. It may have been that the tight dimensions created by a dividing wall in this small house proved uncomfortable, prompting removal of the wall to create a more spacious and functional single room.<sup>3</sup> Since this would not have been a bearing wall, it could have been removed easily. Whether the wall was original or not, it was missing prior to the 1995-97 rehab and was not reinstalled.

Also as part of the recent rehab, a rear addition was rebuilt on the southwest corner. The earlier rear section, whether original or a later addition, was torn down a number of years ago; all that remained were a few remnants in the ground. It was almost certainly of frame rather than stone construction,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Thomas Carter and Peter Goss, *Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940* (Salt Lake City: Center for Architectural Studies, Graduate School of Architecture, University of Utah and Utah State Historical Society, 1991 [reprint]), p. 14-17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>lbid., pp. 11-13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>The removal of walls in nineteenth-century vernacular houses to create larger, more open rooms is not necessarily uncommon. Thomas Carter has documented a pattern of removal of one wall in central passage houses in Utah. See "It Was in the Way So We Took It Out': Remodeling as Social Commentary," *Material Culture* 19 (Summer-Fall 1987): 113-125.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 7 Page 2

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

since there is no evidence of it being integrated into the stonework of the original house. The new addition, following the dimensions of the earlier structure, is flush with the rear wall of the house but projects seven feet beyond the west side wall. Side projections of rear lean-to's are common on many Utah houses of this type and period. They often have a door on the street-facing wall of the projection, providing direct access into the rear lean-to. There is no historic photograph showing the fenestration of the older addition, so an exact reconstruction was not possible. The current addition does not have a door on the street-facing projection, but it does have a door and window on the south wall and a window on the west wall. Its shed roof matches the pitch of the original stone lean-to. The exterior walls are painted wood siding.

The Metcalf House is located at the southern edge of the town of Gunnison, across the Sanpitch River from the main section of the town. No other buildings are located on the property.

\_\_ See continuation sheet

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 8 Page 3

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

#### **Narrative Statement of Significance**

The James & Caroline M. Metcalf House, built c.1883, is one of the best remaining examples of the kinds of structures built by Mormon pioneers in Gunnison during its settlement in the mid- to late-1800s. The vernacular, Classically inspired stone houses in Gunnison describe the level of craftsmanship available and the building traditions of Sanpete Valley. They represent an important period consisting of constructing permanent, visually correct, and functional homes within a communal setting. The Metcalf House is significant as one of only ten remaining Classically detailed, nineteenth-century stone residences in Gunnison.

#### HISTORY OF THE JAMES & CAROLINE M. METCALF HOUSE:

The early history of the Metcalf House is a bit vague. The first recorded transaction for this property was on December 20, 1881, when Hans Larsen was granted title to parcel 7 and James Metcalf, Larsen's son-in-law, was deeded parcel 8 (the house occupies both parcels, but is mostly on parcel 7). Parcel 7 contained 21.75 acres, and parcel 8 consisted of 30.55 acres. Typical of the period, these transactions may have been just formalities, legalizing ownership claims already recognized through an informal local system. Government recording of property records in Utah did not start until the early 1870s, though most towns were settled in the 1850s and 1860s. On January 20, 1883, Hans Larsen transferred parcel 7 to his daughter, Caroline M. Metcalf (James' wife), consolidating the property under James and Caroline's ownership and indicating perhaps the first step toward construction of this house.

Though the stone house was apparently built during the Metcalf's ownership, it is unclear whether they lived there themselves. An 1879 General Land Office survey map shows a "James Metcalf" house in this vicinity, but it is located several hundred feet to the west of the corner location currently occupied by the stone house. The house on the map and the stone house are not likely the same house. Though early surveyors estimated distances at times, and even made errors, the difference here is seemingly too great to be accounted for in that way. The most likely "Metcalf house" referenced on the survey map is the 1-1/2 story hall-parlor or central passage house located just down the street at 224 E. 500 South. That house has lost its historic integrity through the enlargement of its front

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>This map, in addition to its primary purpose as an official survey of the region, shows some 30 homes in the Gunnison area, each labeled with the name of the owner or occupant. The survey was conducted between May 19 and June 2, 1879, and the map was filed with the Surveyor General's Office in Salt Lake City on August 13, 1879. Maps are available on microfilm at the Utah Bureau of Land Management's State Office, 324 S. State, Salt Lake City, Utah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Interview with Mr. Dave Cook by Roger Roper, Feb. 4, 1998. Mr. Cook is currently a cartographic technician with the Utah State Office of the Bureau of Land Management and has worked extensively with the early "cadastral" survey maps and accompanying survey notes since joining the BLM in 1957.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 8 Page 4

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

windows and the installation of aluminum siding on the exterior. It is located on parcel 8, which Metcalf formally received title to in 1881 but apparently "owned" prior to that time. The 1880 manuscript census corroborates the information on the map: the households listed nearby the Metcalf house in the census match those shown in the neighborhood on the 1879 map. The Metcalfs, who married in 1868, were not listed in the 1870 census, so they apparently made their home in Gunnison some time during the 1870s.

Since the stone house does not show up on the 1879 map, it was apparently constructed later, most likely after Caroline Metcalf's parents, Hans and Johanna Larsen, transferred title of parcel 7 to her in 1883. Part of that 1883 transaction included other lots in town, which may be where the Larsens lived during their years in Gunnison. It is possible, though not very likely, that the Larsens built and lived in the stone house and that it was inexplicably omitted from the 1879 survey. Census records seem to confirm the Larsens living elsewhere though; none of their neighbors in either the 1870 or 1880 census match the households shown on the 1879 map.<sup>6</sup>

Still, the question remains as to who lived in the stone house. It seems unlikely that the Metcalfs would move from their larger house to this modest one, especially given the size of their family (5 children) and James' seemingly successful career raising livestock. Had James taken another wife, as many staunch Mormon men did during that period, then this separate stone house would have accommodated one of his families, but there is no indication that he was a polygamist. In fact, given his career shift in the 1890s to operating an alcoholic beverage bottling company, he even may have been an inactive Mormon (the church forbids consumption of alcohol).

Other possible occupants of the stone house may have been relatives or workers assisting with the family livestock business. The 57-plus acres the Metcalfs owned on parcels 7 and 8 may have been the center of their livestock operation. A large livestock shelter, constructed of the same stone as the house, is located nearby to the west, though, it is not on the property included in this nomination.<sup>7</sup> Regardless of who lived in the house, it seems clear that it was constructed during the years the Metcalfs owned it, 1883-1911.

James and Caroline Metcalf and their children apparently made their home in Gunnison from the 1870s through about 1893. Caroline Marie Larsen (1850-1917) was born in Denmark and came to Salt Lake City with her parents in 1862. She married James Metcalf in 1868, and together they had at least five children. A brief biographical sketch of James Metcalf (1847-1922) appeared in the local newspaper upon his death in 1922.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>The Hans and "Hannah" Larsen listed in the 1880 census may not be the same Hans and Johanna

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>According to the current owner of that structure, the remaining 100-foot section is only half its original length; the other section was torn down following damage from an earthquake a few years ago. Also, parcels do not necessarily indicate ownership boundaries.

## National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 8 Page 5

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

James Metcalf was a native of England and when a young lad came to America with his parents. He settled here [Gunnison] in later years and was a resident of Gunnison and the Gunnison Valley for many years. He was active in stock raising and prominent in political circles and was among the foremost in upbuilding the city and valley.<sup>8</sup>

James was also reportedly one of the pioneers in the sheep business in the south part of Sanpete County.<sup>9</sup> The 1880 census lists him as a "farmer and stockraiser." By 1894 the family had moved to Salt Lake City, where James continued in the livestock business for a short time before opening Metcalf & Sons Bottling Co., with sons James Jr. and Fred L., in the late 1890s. The family continued in this business for a number of years.<sup>10</sup> Caroline passed away in 1917, and James died in 1922 in California, where he had moved for health reasons three years previously.

Despite moving to Salt Lake City, the Metcalfs retained ownership of the little stone house in Gunnison until 1911, when they sold it to Anthony Madsen. Perhaps some of the family continued to reside in Gunnison for a time. For example, the 1898 Salt Lake City Polk directory shows James and several other family members residing at the southwest corner of 400 East and Sherman Avenue, while James Jr. was listed as a resident of Gunnison. The stone house and surrounding property may have helped finance the start of the family bottling business in Salt Lake City. James secured a \$100 mortgage on the property from Manti City Savings Bank on October 24, 1896, which is just the time the business appears to have been getting started.

Subsequent owners of the house include Anthony Madsen (1911-31), B.A. Madsen (1931-36), the Federal Land Bank of Berkeley (1936-55), Peter Peterson Jr. (1955-58), LaVor and Neva Peterson (1958-66), Keller Christensen and KC Farms (1966-94), and Roger G. and Pamela A. Baker, 1994-present.

#### **GUNNISON HISTORY:**

The establishment of Gunnison in 1862 resulted from the resettlement and merging of two earlier communities, each built up in 1859 along the lower Sanpitch River in upper Gunnison Valley. During a visit in 1862, Mormon leader Brigham Young saw the limitations of the swampy area and advised the people to move up to the bench area, where a new town was built. The town was named in honor of government explorer Captain John Gunnison, who was killed with six of his men by Indians while in Central Utah in 1853.

<sup>8&</sup>quot;James Metcalf, Sr., Dies In California," Gunnison Valley News, September 28, 1922 p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Albert C.T. Antrei, editor, The Other Forty-Niners: A Topical History of Sanpete County, Utah, 1849-1983, p. 279.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>Polk Directories for Salt Lake City, 1890s and early 1900s. Available in the Utah State Historical Society Library.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 8 Page 6

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

Joseph S. Horne was sent from Salt Lake City to serve as bishop in 1868. He directed the creation of a cooperative store, the opening of a rock-salt mine, and in 1876 he was acknowledged for his role in managing the building of schools, meetinghouses, mercantile stores, private houses, grist and sawmills, and salt boilers, as well as overseeing the improvement of roads, enlargement of farming lands, and the extension of tree planting and other home industries.

Gunnison's fortunes prospered and the city's population more than doubled in the decade ending in 1900. As it grew, Gunnison developed as a commercial center of the valley, featuring flour and feed mills, a co-op store, general and specialty stores, and the Gunnison Valley Bank. Religious, civic, and educational facilities were built as the city expanded, including a dance hall in 1896, and a new city hall and rock school in 1899. The telegraph had arrived in 1882 and Gunnison officially became a town in 1893.<sup>11</sup>

The construction of the city's earliest buildings was aided by a vertical "pit-saw" sawmill built in 1863, followed soon after by a horse-powered circular sawmill. Many of the early structures were erected by stone mason Christ Tollestrup, adobe craftsmen Eric Larsen and Harmon Christensen, and carpenter William Christensen.

#### **ARCHITECTURE:**

Mormon planning in the Sanpete Valley reflects their religious beliefs. Communitarian values such as cooperation and unity were advanced through the implementation of a nucleated settlement pattern. Within this pattern, the single family dwelling was the prevailing residential unit.<sup>12</sup> No specific designs were recommended, however, the quality of housing was described by Brigham Young in 1860:

Good houses are comfortable and very convenient, and pleasure our feelings, and are tolerably healthful when properly ventilated. If we cannot raise grain, raise houses, and build the best houses we can think of. If you are going to do a good deed, do as good a one as you can think of. If you wish to build a house, build as good a one as you can imagine.<sup>13</sup>

The message was to build solid, pleasing houses by utilizing the building traditions that came with the immigrants into the Sanpete Valley.<sup>14</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>Allen Roberts, "Gunnison," *Utah History Encyclopedia*. Alan Kent Powell, editor. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>Thomas Robert Carter, "Building Zion: Folk Architecture in the Mormon Settlements of Utah's Sanpete Valley, 1849-1890," (Dissertation, Department of Folklore, Indiana University, 1984), pp.87, 89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup>Quoted in Carter, "Building Zion," p. 85.

<sup>14</sup>Carter, "Building Zion," p.85.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 8 Page 7

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

Primarily Classical style buildings were constructed during the settlement period in this area. They incorporated geometrical composition and symmetrical balance with their rectangular facades, centrally placed doors, and smooth, regularly punctuated elevations.<sup>15</sup> Classical characteristics, such as proportion and balance to create a harmonious whole, included the way in which the building would be used. Also, function was an important component in the folk building tradition. The plan of the house was to be built within an appropriate form.<sup>16</sup> The use of indigenous materials, such as oolitic limestone in Gunnison, also helped to shape the architectural landscape. The Metcalf incorporates these features and is an excellent example of the original permanent and substantial homes being built in Gunnison during the 1870s-80s. It remains as one of only ten known stone houses constructed prior to 1900. From the remaining buildings in Gunnison, there are roughly equal numbers of stone, adobe, and brick buildings with a period of construction that dates prior to 1900.<sup>17</sup>

The Metcalf House is architecturally significant in Gunnison. It is a vernacular, rather than high-style, building, reflecting house forms common in Utah and throughout the United States during the nineteenth century. The original c.1883 hall-parlor was a substantial house form that remained popular in Utah until well into the 1890s. The hall-parlor and other earlier house types (single cell, double-cell, central passage, etc.) were usually detailed with Classical elements, such as Greek Revival returns on the gable ends. The Metcalf House is a clear representative of this architectural trend.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>Thomas Carter and Peter Goss, *Utah's Historic Architecture*, p.95.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup>Carter, "Building Zion, p.94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>The 1997 Reconnaissance Level Survey shows that 13 adobe (and stucco, assumed to be over adobe), 18 stone, and 14 brick buildings were constructed prior to 1901.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>Thomas Carter and Peter Goss, *Utah's Historic Architecture*, pp. 11-13.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section No. 9 Page 8

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

#### **Bibliography**

Carter, Thomas and Peter Goss. *Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940.* Salt Lake City, UT: University of Utah Graduate School of Architecture and Utah State Historical Society, 1991.

Carter, Thomas Robert. "Building Zion: Folk Architecture in the Mormon Settlements of Utah's Sanpete Valley, 1849-1890." Dissertation, Department of Folklore, Indiana University, 1984

Roberts, Allen. "Gunnison", *Utah History Encyclopedia*. Alan Kent Powell, editor. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1995.

#### Other Sources:

Census records, 1870, 1880, for Gunnison.

Utah Gazetteer, 1879-1903.

# **National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet**

Section No. PHOTOS Page 9

Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House, Gunnison, Sanpete County, UT

#### **Common Label Information:**

- 1. Metcalf, James & Caroline M., House
- 2. Gunnison, Sanpete County, Utah
- 3. Photographer: Roger Roper
- 4. Date: January 1998
- 5. Negative on file at Utah SHPO.

#### Photo No. 1:

6. Northwest elevation of building. Camera facing southeast.

#### Photo No. 2:

6. Northeast elevation of building. Camera facing southwest.

#### Photo No. 3:

6. Southeast elevation of building. Camera facing northwest.

### METCALF HOUSE GUNNISON, SANPETE COUNTY, UTAH JANUARY 1998

C. 1883 (STONE)

1997 (RECONSTRUCTION)



