NPS Form 10-900 (Oct. 1990)

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Registration Form

NATIONAL PARA SLEVICE

1, Name of Property		
historic nameButler-Wallin House		
other name/site number <u>Butler Farm; Wallin Far</u>	m; Jensen Dairy	
2. Location		
street & town 1045 E. 4500 South		not for publication
city or townSalt Lake County		vicinity
state Utah code UT	county_Salt_Lakecode_035zip_code_841	17
3. State/Federal Agency Certification		
 ☐ request for determination of eligibility meets the of Historic Places and meets the procedural and proproperty ⊠ meets ☐ does not meet the National R ☐ nationally ☐ statewide ⊠ locally. ☐ See continues of certifying official/Title <u>Utah Division of State History. Office of Historic Pres</u> State or Federal agency and bureau 	9/25/125 Date	tional Register inion, the significant
Signature of certifying official/Title	Date	
State or Federal agency and bureau 4. National Park Service Certification I hereby certify that the property is: I hereby certify that the property is: I hereby certify that the property is: I determined in the National Register. I determined eligible for the National Register I See continuation sheet. I determined not eligible for the National Register. I removed from the National	Signature of the Keeper Carson / Ball	Date of Action
Register.		

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. See instructions in *How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form* (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x' in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on

continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer, to complete all items.

Butler-Wallin House Name of Property

Salt Lake County, Utah City, County and State

5. Classification Ownership of Property (check as many boxes as apply)	Category of Property (check only one box)	Number of Resource (Do not include previously	ces within Property listed resources in the cou	nt.)
public-local	district	Contributing	Noncontributing	
🛛 private	🛛 building(s)	2	0	buildings
public-State	🗔 site			sites
public-Federal	Structure	<u></u>		structures
	🗌 object			objects
		2	0	Total
Name of related multiple pro (Enter "N/A" if property is not part of a		Number of contribuin the National Reg	iting resources prev ister	iously listed
N/A		N/A		
7. Description Architectural Classification (Enter categories from instructions)			es from instructions)	
LATE 19 TH AND 20 TH CENTURY F	REVIVALS	foundation _		
Other: Period Revival		walls	WOOD: Clapboard sid	ding
Other: English Tudor & Colonial R	evival			
		roof	COMPOSITE SHING	_E
		other		

Narrative Description (Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

See continuation sheet(s) for Section No. 7

Butler-Wallin House Name of Property

0

8. Description	
Applicable National Register Criteria (Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing.)	Areas of Significance (enter categories from instructions)
A Property is associated with events that have made	ARCHITECTURE
a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.	AGRICULTURE
B Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.	
C Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.	
D Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.	Period of Significance 1928-1955
Criteria Considerations (Mark "x" in all the boxes that apply.)	·
Property is:	Significant Dates 1928
A owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.	1932, 1934-1935, 1946
B removed from its original location.	Significant Persons (Complete if Criterion B is marked above) N/A
C a birthplace or grave.	
D a cemetery.	Cultural Affiliation N/A
E a reconstructed building, object, or structure.	
F a commemorative property.	Architect/Builder Robert W. Butler: Architect & Builder
G less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.	
Narrative Statement of Significance	
(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)	See continuation sheet(s) for Section No. 8
9. Major Bibliographical References Bibliography (Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more con	tinuation sheets.
Previous documentation on file (NPS):	Primary location of additional data:
 preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested previously listed in the National Register previously determined eligible by the National Register designated a National Historic Landmark recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey 	 State Historic Preservation Office Other State agency Federal agency Local government University Other Name of repository:
Recorded by Historic American Engineering Record #	See continuation sheet(s) for Section No. 9

Salt Lake County, Utah City, County and State

10. Geographical Data

Acreage of Property 0.43 acres

UTM References

(Place additional boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet.)

1 <u>1/2</u>	<u>4/2/7/2/8/0</u>	<u>4/5/0/2/7/8/0</u>	2 <u>/</u>	<u>/////</u>	/ / / / / /
Zone	Easting	Northing	Zone	Easting	Northing
3 <u>/</u>	<u>/////</u>	<u>/ / / / / /</u>	4 <u>/</u>	<u>/ / / / /</u>	///////
Zone	Easting	Northing	Zone	Easting	Northing
Verbal Boundary Description					

(Describe the boundaries of the property.)

BEG W 420. FT S & N 20 FT FR SE COR OF LOT 1, BLK 4 TEN ACRE PLAT A, BIG FIELD SUR; W 140.18 FT; N 132 FT; E 140.18 FT; S 132 FT TO BEG.

Property Tax No. 22 - 05 - 402 - 003

Boundary Justification

(Explain why the boundaries were selected.)

The current boundaries are a remnant of the historic boundaries, but include the only remaining buildings from the property's period of significance.

See continuation sheet(s) for Section No. 10

11. Form Prepared By

name/title Korral Broschinsky	
organization Preservation Documentation Resource	date <u>March 17, 2005</u>
street & number_P. O. Box 58766	telephone (801) 913-5645
city or town Salt Lake City	state UT zip code 84158

Additional Documentation Submit the following items with the completed form:

Continuation Sheets

 Maps A USGS map (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location. A Sketch map for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources.
 Photographs: Representative black and white photographs of the property.
 Additional items: (Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)

Property Owner	
name/titleJohn and Renae Walker; ManageMen	
street & number 1045 E. 4500 South	telephone (801) 263-0861
city or town Salt Lake City	state UT zip code 84117

Paperwork Reduction Act Statement: This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties, and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 470 et seq.).

Estimated Burden Statement: Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18.1 hours per response including time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding this burden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, P.O. Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Projects (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.

Section No. 7 Page 1

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

NARRATIVE DESCRIPTION

The Butler-Wallin House, built circa 1928-1929, is located at 1045 E. 4500 South in Salt Lake County.¹ The house is a $1\frac{1}{2}$ -story frame building covered in clapboard siding. The house is a period revival-era residence displaying elements of both the English Tudor and the Colonial Revival styles. The house is built on a concrete foundation and has a new composite shingle roof (2003). A $1\frac{1}{2}$ -story frame addition was built on the rear of the house around 1934-1935. It was built with the same materials as the original structure. The house sits in the middle of a 0.43-acre parcel of mature landscaping. There is a contributing three-car garage on the property. The house has been used commercially since the 1980s. It was rehabilitated 2002-2003 by the current owners, John and Renae Walker. Despite its commercial use, the Butler-Wallin House is in excellent condition and retains its domestic feel.

The Butler-Wallin House faces south. The ridgeline of the roof is parallel to the street. In mass, the style of the house is predominantly Colonial Revival with a primarily symmetrical façade and shed-roof dormers flanking the projecting front porch. There is also a slightly setback one-story sunroom wing to the east, which is typical of the Colonial Revival style. However, the focal point of the façade is the steeply-pitched gable of the porch wing, which is characteristic of the period revival English Tudor style. The tapered and stucco-covered chimney stack on the west elevation is also an English Tudor element. The front porch features a hybrid of styles. A small balcony is supported on fluted Doric columns of wood. Above the wide plain frieze and a dentilated cornice are square posts and a craftsman-like balustrade. Historic photographs indicate the balustrade was missing for many years. It was rebuilt in 2004 using photographic evidence and the extant balustrade around the balcony above the sunroom. The balcony above the sunroom is accessible and therefore the original balustrade was raised in the 1980s for safety reasons. The front door is original and features four panels and a fanlight. It was recently painted a dark slate to contrast with the new grey paint on the clapboard siding. The shutters were an original feature. All wood trim on the house has been painted white.²

The windows on the house are original. On the three primary elevations, the windows are multi-pane windows set in a wood sash. The main level windows are tall and narrow and found in ten-light pairs, while the upper windows are six-over-six, double-hung windows. Several windows on the secondary elevations are six-over-one windows. The balcony doors are French. There is a rear entrance on the north elevation of the sunroom with a half-glass door. There is also a half-glass door on the west elevation, which is located in the addition under a simple gable supported on square columns. The north elevation has larger fixed-frame windows on the upper level. The house has a number of original storm windows that are still in use on the exterior of the house. Other decorative elements include diamond vents in the east and west gables, and a box cornice with slightly curved returns. The new roof simulates the fish-scale pattern of the original.

¹ The property is located in unincorporated Salt Lake County between the boundaries of Murray City and Holladay. Various historic records list the property as within all three communities. The current owners use Salt Lake City as their address. The first address of the house was 1049 East until 1935 when it was changed to 1045 East.

² The original paint on the house was probably white. The house was painted blue in the 1980s and 1990s.

Section No. 7 Page 2

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

On the interior, the house has approximately 3,000 square feet of space divided between three levels. The main floor is 1,290 square feet. The front entrance leads to a fover, which has Tudor-arched openings. There is a central open stair, which is original and has a curved newel post and lathe-turn balusters. West of the stair is the living room. The fireplace, mantel and tile hearth are original, although the fireplace and chimney were brought up to fire code in 2003. The large living room was partially enclosed in 2003 to create a conference room and lobby/sitting room for the current owners. The living room partition uses multi-pane glass for the French doors and windows. The partition is a reversible alteration. East of the stair is the former dining room, now used as a reception area. The sunroom is currently used as an office and also has multi-pane French doors. The kitchen is north of the dining room. There is a breakfast nook in the northeast corner with a built-in corner cupboard. In the rear of the main floor are a back bedroom and a bathroom. A narrow staircase in the 1934-1935 addition was built for the owner's children. The basement stairs are near the west entrance. All the main floor finishes were updated during the 2003 rehabilitation. The upper floor is 902 square feet. It is divided into three bedroom spaces (now offices), a bathroom, and a rear family room (also office). The space in the southwest corner was divided into two bedrooms in approximately the 1950s. The rooms vary in side and placed within the intersecting gables. There is a small room above the foyer, which may have been used as a nursery originally. There are a large number of built-in cabinets and closets in the upper bedroom. The upper floor was also completely refinished in 2003. There is no useable attic space. The basement is approximately 861 square feet. It is excavated under the original house and is mostly unfinished. It is currently used for storage. The furnace and air conditioning were also replaced in 2003 to meet safety code.

The Butler-Wallin House property has been a distinctive part of the neighborhood landscape since its construction. It was once the farmhouse for a 35-acre show farm on one of Salt Lake County's major east-west thoroughfares. The farmland was north of 4500 South with the house on the main street. Between the 1960s and 1980s, the farmland was sold off for an elementary school and residential development. The remaining parcel is 0.43 acres. The only remaining outbuilding is the three-car frame garage built circa 1930. The garage is unusually large for the time period, measuring 30 feet wide by 21 deep. The garage has a simple gable roof parallel to the street and is slightly wider at the rear. The garage was in disrepair and the narrow clapboard siding on the rear elevation was replaced with matching wood clapboards in 2004. The roof was rebuilt in 2002. The three garage doors are new (2004), and replaced the originals, which were non-functioning with missing windows. Like the original doors, the new doors have four-light windows above lower panels. There is a small original window on the east elevation. A new door was installed in the west elevation. The garage has a concrete floor and is currently used for (material not vehicle) storage.

The Butler-Wallin House is known in the neighborhood for its meticulous and mature landscaping. There is a concrete drive and parking area on the west side in front of the garage. A small asphalt lot is behind the garage. The rest of the parcel is landscaped with lawn, flowerbeds, shrubs, and large trees. The vinyl picket fence is new, but the owners have incorporated several extant remnants of the original ball & post metal fencing. There are several old Victorian farmhouses, brick bungalows and cottages, spaced along 4500 South in the immediate area,

Section No. 7 Page 3

...

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

but the Butler-Wallin House is the only substantial frame residence from the period revival era in the area.³ Its pristine architectural integrity and make is a significant contributing resource in central Salt Lake County.

³ Its only architectural rival in the neighborhood was the Colonial Revival farmhouse at 1680 E. 4500 South, also designed and built by Robert Butler in the early 1920s. This home was also part of a large farm, which had survived many years and unfortunately demolished for commercial development in 2003.

Section No. 8 Page 1

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

NARRATIVE STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The Butler-Wallin House, built in 1928-1929, is a 1¹/₂-story Period Revival-style residence. The house is significant under Criteria A for its association with the agricultural and suburban development of central Salt Lake County. The Butler-Wallin House was originally built as the showpiece of a 35-acre farm. The house and farm had several owners during the historic period, and each had different agricultural use for the property. The farm acreage land was sold for residential development between the 1950s and 1980s, but the house remains a distinctive reminder of the neighborhood's agricultural heritage. The Butler-Wallin House is a rare example of a farmhouse that represents a subset of second-generation Salt Lake County residents, the "gentlemen" farmers. Prosperous businessmen, who like Robert Butler and Alvin G. Wallin, kept their in-town jobs while maintaining suburban farms for hobby, experimentation, and educational purposes. The Butler-Wallin House is also significant under Criterion C as an architectural landmark in the area. The Butler-Wallin House was designed by the first owner, Robert W. Butler, whose avocation was architecture. The design of the house was derived from published plans for farmhouses, but adapted by Butler to produce a period revival hybrid of the English Tudor and Colonial Revival styles. It is the only substantial period revival-style frame house in the area. The home's beautiful architecture and lush landscaping made it a popular venue for weddings, receptions, and other social events during the historic period. The Butler-Wallin House and landscape contribute to the historic resources of its Salt Lake County neighborhood.

History Of The Butler-Wallin House

On July 24, 1847, a small contingent of members of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (LDS or Mormon Church) entered the Salt Lake Valley under the direction of Brigham Young. On August 2, 1847, a little more than a week later, the City of Great Salt Lake was surveyed according to the City of Zion plat, an ideal city layout designed by church founder Joseph Smith, which provided for a residential core surrounded by farmland. In 1848, the surveyors laid out what became known as the Big Field Survey to the south beyond the southern boundary of the original city plats (today's 900 South). Between 900 South and 2100 South, the land was laid out in rectangular blocks divided into five-acre lots, and known as the Five-Acre Survey. Further south, between 2100 South and 4500 South, the land was divided into larger lots of ten acres for the Ten-Acre Survey. As soon as the Big Field surveys were completed, the lots were assigned to individual owners. There were a few scattered homes built in the late nineteenth century, but most of the land was used for agriculture. By the early years of the twentieth century, the northern portions of the Big Field survey area was developed extensively and absorbed into the city, but the southern parts (below 2700 South) remained primarily agricultural until the suburban boom of the 1950s. The borders of the survey blocks are still evident in the major thoroughfares through the area. Today's 4500 South (known as 16th South until 1917) was the southern boundary of the Ten-Acre Survey.

Section No. 8 Page 2

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

The Butler-Wallin House, located at 1045 E. 4500 South, was on the southern edge of the platted farmlands of Salt Lake County. The house is located within the Ten-Acre Survey, on Lot 1 of Block 4. The property was originally part of a large farmstead owned in pioneer times by Edward Pugh. The National Register listed adobe home of his wife Mary Ann Pugh, built circa 1862 and located at 1299 E. 4500 South, was for many years the only house in the neighborhood. After Mary Ann's death in 1895, Edward Pugh deeded the property to Mary Ann's son from her first marriage, George A. Williams. After the death of George A. Williams in 1907, the estate property was deeded to his wife Emily Williams and their children. On February 14, 1928, Robert W. Butler purchased part of Lot 1 and other property from George B. and Leah Williams, Annetta E. (Williams) Smith and Rhoda A. (Williams) Caspar. He purchased additional property from Mervin and Vern Andrus to form a farm parcel of approximately 35 acres. The property included stock in the local water company. The Big Ditch Company had been organized in the pioneer era, to facilitate the distribution of water from the Big Cottonwood Creek to nearby farms.

Robert William Butler was born in Salt Lake City, on July 16, 1887. He was the son of English immigrants, Thomas and Annie L. Hillstead Butler. Robert Butler married Ruby Margaret Rice on June 10, 1911. She was born in Conant, Idaho, on April 1, 1888. Her parents were Edwin and Sylvia Drake Rice. The couple had three sons, Robert Jr., Arthur and Richard. Robert W. Butler was a manager for the Mine & Smelter Supply Company for 46 years. He served a term in the Utah legislature in the early 1940s. According to those who knew him, Robert Butler had a great love for architecture and landscape design.⁴ The first home he designed was a traditional Colonial Revival frame farmhouse, built on a large parcel at 1680 E. 4500 South.⁵ In 1928, Robert Butler purchased the Williams property with the intent to start a dairy and thoroughbred horse farm. He designed a new home at 1045 East 4500 South with his own T-square and drafting table when he was 41 years old. With a mortgage of \$8,000 from the Tracy Loan & Trust Company, he served as general contractor for the project. He hired David Small to do the framing and carpentry work, and George Goodmanson did the lathe and plaster walls.⁶ Robert Butler gave considerable attention to the design of the surrounding gardens and outbuildings, which included a rare three-car garage, a caretaker's cottage and a large barn. The stately farmhouse was a landmark in the neighborhood soon after completion.

At the time the house was built the Butler family enjoyed a degree of prosperity. The 1930 census enumeration lists the family living on 4500 South in a home valued at \$20,000 (an enormous sum for Salt Lake City at the time) and with a live-in maid (Dorothy Somsen from Idaho). Unfortunately, Robert Butler's fortunes were not immune from the depression-era economy. Probably as the result of a chattel mortgage, which included the house, the farm and the crops, the Butler family lost the farm. In May 1935, the property was sold at a Salt Lake sheriff's auction to A. G. Wallin for \$5,463.81. The Butlers moved to a city lot on Salt Lake's east bench. Robert Butler was later transferred to Denver, Colorado. In their later years, Robert and Ruby Butler moved to

⁴ A National Register nomination for the Butler House was prepared in 1979. Research notes included several interviews with neighbors who remembered the Butler family and other owners in the historic period. The nomination was rejected because the discussion did not include sufficient justification for significance.

⁵ This house, later known as the Petty home and the Smith Dairy, was demolished in 2003 for commercial development. ⁶ David Small and George Goodmanson were reportedly from Salt Lake City and Holladay respectively. However, no further information could be located.

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

Beaverton, Oregon, to be near their son, Arthur, and his family. Robert W. Butler died in Beaverton on August 2, 1966. Ruby Rice Butler died on August 9, 1972. They were buried in the Salt Lake City Cemetery.

A. G. Wallin, the second owner of the house, was a friend of the Butler family. Alvin George Wallin was born on September 18, 1896, in Murray, Utah. He married Lillian Rynearson on August 14, 1918. Lillian was born on December 12, 1894, in Millcreek, Utah. Alvin Wallin was the founder and president of Paragon Press, a Salt Lake-based printing company still in business today. Alvin Wallin moved his family to the farmhouse in 1934 or 1935. The Wallin family added the rear addition to accommodate their family of three sons and four daughters. The narrow staircase was added to allow the children to access their bedrooms without going through the front rooms and disturbing company. The addition also included a bathroom, a laundry and a new side porch. The stateliness and appeal of the Wallin home made it a popular location for community weddings, receptions and other events.

Wallin continued the dairy farm operations on the property. He purchased most of Butler's stock, which included a herd of Golden Guernsey show cattle. He sold the dairy milk to the Golden Guernsey Association, who processed it and sold it retail for 15 cents. Wallin sold his cream to the founder of the Cummings Candy, a chocolate candy company still in business in Salt Lake City. He installed one of the first walk-in cold storage boxes in the county. Wallin was a prize-winning breeder on the fair circuit and also raised Dapple Grey Persian horses and Hampshire hogs on the property. He would breed his animals and sell the offspring to other farmers and ranchers in the area. The Utah & Idaho Sugar Company used the farm as their show farm for sugar beet demonstrations and exhibits.⁷

In October 1942, Alvin G. Wallin sold the property to C. Taylor and Hilda H. Burton, and moved his family back into the city. They later purchased a suburban home on the southeast bench. Alvin G. Wallin died on February 14, 1960. Lillian R. Wallin died on November 30, 1981. They were buried at the Elysian Burial Gardens just one block south of their former home on 4500 South. Carl Taylor Burton was born in 1912. Hilda Hansen was born in Logan, in 1913. They were married in 1935 and had four children. The Burton Lumber Company was involved in property development and home building. C. Taylor was noted for his pioneering work in building affordable housing for returning World War II veterans. He served as president of the Utah Home Builder's Association. He was first elected to the Utah Senate in the 1950s and was later responsible for the development Utah's interstate highway system. The Burton family lived on 4500 South between 1942 and 1945, when they sold the property to Roiva and Venice Jensen. Hilda H. Burton died in 1997 and C. Taylor Burton died in 2003.

Roiva, also known as Roy, Miller Jensen was born in 1904. His wife, Venice Lucile Farnsworth, was born in 1905. They had four children. Although Roy Jensen was a general contractor by profession, the family ran operated the dairy farm and it is still remembered by older neighbors as the Jensen Dairy. During the time the Jensen family ran the dairy, the city directories list Lyle and Helen J. Johnson living at the rear of 1045 E. 4500 South, probably meaning the caretaker's cottage. Lyle Johnson's occupation is given as farmer. In April 1946,

⁷ This arrangement may have started earlier since the title records suggest that the Sugar Beet Corporation had an interest in the property during the time it was owned by Robert and Ruby Butler.

Section No. 8 Page 4

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

Roiva Jensen deeded the property to Venice F. Jensen. Roiva and Venice Jensen both died in 1986. Venice Jensen sold the property to John E. Berry Jr. and his wife, Clara (or Clare) K. Berry in October 1954. ohn "Jack" Berry worked as a freight agent for the Denver & Rio Grande Railroad while they lived in the house. According to their daughter, Leslie Berry Symer, Clara's mother Elise Berry lived with them until her death in 1955. She asked to be buried in the nearby Elysian Burial Gardens. During the 1950s and 1960s most of the farm acreage was sold off and the outbuildings demolished for residential development. The Hill View Elementary School was built just north of the house. John and Clara Berry sold the house to Lionel J. and Carolyn O. Bradford in 1963 when they moved to Colorado.

Lionel J. and Carolyn Bradford lived in the house until their deaths. They were married in 1947 and had two sons. Lionel James Bradford worked for the State of Utah. He reportedly had a heart attack while mowing the front lawn in 1975. Carolyn Olson Bradford worked for the Sperry Rand Corporation. In April 1977, just six months before her death, she sold the property to Richard Lucus, although her estate retained an interest until 1991. The house was used for commercial purposes after the death of Carolyn Bradford. It had a succession of owners and the title was transferred from Richard Lucus to Thomas Heal to Steven J. Nelson. Steven J. Nelson tried unsuccessfully to get the house listed on the listed on the National Register in 1979.

In July 1984, Steven J. Nelson quit claimed the property to the estate of Carolyn Bradford. It was then sold to the First American Capital Corporation. In December 1984, the company donated a portion of the frontage to Salt Lake County for improvements along 4500 South. The open irrigation ditch was rebuilt and remains a distinctive part of the property. The busy thoroughfare and addition of more parking north of the garage made the location ideal for commercial use. During this time, the house was used by the Post Exchange Realty Company, although the city directories note several years of vacancy. Between 1987 and 2002, the property changed hands five times. The Unishippers Association was the longest tenant during this period. The Superior Title Company used the house as their office beginning in 1998. On December 5, 2002, John and Renae Walker, the current owners, purchased the property. They are in the process of an ongoing rehabilitation of house that began in 2002 for the building's use as the corporate headquarters of ManageMen, a consulting and education firm specializing facility cleaning and maintenance. Most of the rehabilitation that has been completed to date has been structural, roofing, siding, and exterior painting, restoration, and other items as described in Section 7.

Agriculture

Although the Butler-Wallin House farm acreage was sold off and outbuildings demolished, the agricultural significance of the property should not be understated. The Salt Lake County neighborhood where the Butler-Wallin House is located has been pressured by suburban developed from expanding communities on three sides (Salt Lake City to the north, Murray to the southwest, and Holladay to the southeast) since the 1950s. The house at 1680 E. 4500 South, Robert Butler's first design, was one of the last semi-agricultural parcels to be developed (the house was demolished in 2003). There are very few physical reminders of the area's agricultural past. The Pugh house and a handful of Victorian-era residences along 4500 South are the only remnants of the

Section No. 8 Page 5

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

subsistence-level agriculture of the pioneer-era. There are also a few twentieth-century farmhouses (e.g. brick bungalows and period revival cottages), but most are similar in style and type to homes in Salt Lake City's urban neighborhoods in the same period. Butler-Wallin House is a rare example of a farmhouse, which is almost a mansion and designed for the comfort of the "gentlemen" farmers and their families, Salt Lake County's prosperous second-generation residents. Robert Butler and Alvin G. Wallin were both successful businessmen who kept their in-town jobs while maintaining suburban farms and residences as a hobby.

Historic tax records list the agricultural outbuildings once associated with the property. Some were built in 1928, probably before the house was completed. In addition to the three-car garage and caretaker's cottage, there was a dairy barn, hay barn, stock shelter, milk house, tool house, two coops (one built in 1935), and a shed. (The tax cards do not indicate where the cold storage was located). The farm acreage and most of the outbuildings was separated from the house property beginning in 1954, but the property was clearly a working farm throughout the historic period.

The Butler-Wallin House is the only surviving building from an era when the farm had known ties to several important economic entities: the Golden Guernsey Association, the Cummings Candy Company and the Utah-Idaho Sugar Company. The Utah & Idaho Sugar Company, founded in 1891 and still in operation, was not only an important part of Utah's economy in the twentieth century, but had sugar beet farms and factories in six western states and Canada. Although not a production location, the Butler-Wallin farm was a status showplace for demonstrations and exhibits.

Architecture

The Butler-Wallin House, with its distinguished architecture and park-like settings, makes an impression on those who drive along 4500 South in Salt Lake County. Robert Butler's design was partially based on published plans of farmhouses, but combines two of the most popular house styles of the period. The Colonial Revival movement began with the centennial celebration of American Independence in 1876. Instead of rejecting the colonial past, architects began looking to reinterpret the architectural building styles "exported to the colonies during the century and a half of British rule".⁸ The Colonial Revival style was popular in high-end architecture in Utah in the 1920s and 1930s. The Butler-Wallin House exhibits the following elements of the Colonial Revival style: façade symmetry, fanlights, multi-light sashes, a dentillated cornice, fluted columns, and a one-story side wing. The Butler-Wallin House also features a steeply pitched gable over the central porch, a feature most often found during the period revival era as an element of the English Tudor style. The tapered stucco-covered chimneystack is also reminiscent of the English Tudor style. The period revival styles were very popular in Utah in the 1920s and 1930s, and examples are found both as architect-designed and modest tract housing produced by speculative builders. The majority of English-Tudor style cottages in Utah are built of brick and similar to the house just east of the Butler property. The Butler-Wallin House not only represents a

⁸ Virginia and Lee McAlester, *Great American Houses and Their Architectural Styles*, (New York: Abbeville Press), 204.

Section No. 8 Page 6

n

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

distinctive architectural hybrid of two styles, but also a less common frame example from the period. An informal survey of the area and a search of the architectural database for Salt Lake County confirmed the Butler-Wallin House's uniqueness and prominence in the community. The beautifully maintained buildings and grounds serve to highlight the Butler-Wallin House's significance. The Butler-Wallin House is eligible for the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing historical and architectural resource in suburban Salt Lake County.

Section No. 9 Page 1

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

Bibliography

[Ancestral File]. Available online at the Family Search website (www.familysearch.org).

- Arrington, Leonard. Beet sugar in the West; a history of the Utah-Idaho Sugar Company, 1891-1966. Seattle, Washington: University of Washington Press, 1966.
- Carter, Thomas and Peter Goss. Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940, A Guide. Salt Lake City, Utah: University of Utah Press, 1988.

Deseret News.

- Keene, J. Phillip. *National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form: Robert Butler House*. Draft nomination prepared March, 1979. Nomination and accompanying materials available at the Utah State Historic Preservation Office.
- McAlester, Virginia and Lee. *Great American Houses and Their Architectural Styles*, (New York: Abbeville Press).
- [Miscellaneous files on the Butler House.] File folder of materials in possession of the Walker family, current owners of the Butler-Wallin House.
- *Polk Directories, Salt Lake City, 1925-1993.* Published by R.L. Polk & Co. Available at the Utah State Historical Society and the Marriott Library, University of Utah.
- [Salt Lake County Tax Cards and Photographs]. Available at the Salt Lake County Archives.

[Salt Lake County Title Abstracts]. Available at the Salt Lake County Recorder's Office.

Salt Lake Tribune.

- Taylor, Fred. G. A saga of sugar, being a story of the romance and development of beet sugar in the Rocky Mountain West. [Salt Lake City, Utah-Idaho Sugar Company, 1944].
- [Utah State Historical Society Burials Database]. Available online at Historical Society's website (www.history.utah.gov).
- Walker, Renae and John. "Butler House: Preservation Project." Unpublished TMs, dated July 5, 2004. Available from the Walker family and ManageMen.

Walker, Renae and Lisa Walker. Interviews conducted by author, Salt Lake County, October-November, 2004.

Section No. PHOTOS Page 1

Butler-Wallin House, Salt Lake County, UT

Common Label Information:

- 1. Butler-Wallin House
- 2. 1045 East 4500 South, Salt Lake County, Utah
- 3. Photographer: Korral Broschinsky
- 4. Date: November 2004
- 5. Negative on file at Utah SHPO.

Archival Photographs

Photo No. 1:

6. South elevation. Camera facing north.

Photo No. 2:

6. South and east elevations of house. Camera facing northwest.

Photo No. 3:

6. South elevation, front porch detail. Camera facing north.

Photo No. 4:

6. North elevation of house. Camera facing south.

Photo No. 5:

6. West elevation of house. Camera facing east.

Photo No. 6:

6. South elevation of garage. Camera facing northwest.

Supplemental Photograph

Photo No. 7:

6. East and north elevations of house. Camera facing southwest.



BUTLER, ROBERT & RUBY, HOUSE 1045 E 4500 SOUTH, SALT LAKE COUNTY, UTAH AKA: Butler-Wallin House



n use by ake way st each orated

risit today He would lace in ho

designed.

remain in the house today.



was probably taken in 1934 and shows small trees Earliest known photograph of the Butler House

Butler, Robert and Ruby, House salt Lake City, Salt Lake County, UT 045 E. 4500 South

where mature trees now stand.

Robert Butler operated a 35 acre farm surrounding