NPS Form 10-900 (Oct. 1990)

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places

1224

OMB No. 10024-0018 - <u>1</u>. e. d. NAT REC NATIONAL PARK

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. See instructions in *How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form* (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "NA" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer, to complete all items.

#### 1. Name of Property

**Registration Form** 

historic name \_Butler, Roswell, House

other names/site number ----

2. Location

street & number6_Carmichae	el Street	ħ/a	not for publication
city or town Essex			na vicinity
state Vermont	code VT county Chittenden	code <u>007</u>	zip code 05451

### 3. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended, I hereby certify that this I nomination request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property meets does not meet the National Register criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant nationally statewide I locally. (See continuation sheet for additional comments.) <u>Augume C. Jamelo Maticnal Register Specializet August 13,</u> 2001 Signature of certifying official/Title

Vermont State Historic Preservation Office

State or Federal agency and bureau

In my opinion, the property \_ \_ \_ meets \_ \_ does not meet the National Register criteria ( \_ \_ See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature of certifying official/Title

Date

State or Federal agency and bureau

4. N	ational Park Service Certificatio	n	
I hereby	certify that the property is:	Signature of the Keeper	Date of Action
	entered in the National Register See continuation sheet determined eligible for the National Register	Entered in the Netional Register	<u> </u>
	See continuation sheet determined not eligible for the National Register		
	removed from the National Register		
	other, (explain:)		

Butler, Roswell, House \_\_\_\_\_ Name of Property

\_

Chittenden County, Vermont County and State

5. Classification				
Ownership of Property (Check as many boxes as apply)	Category of Property (Check only one box)	Number of Re (Do not include pre	sources within Prop	erty count)
<ul> <li>private</li> <li>public-local</li> <li>public-State</li> <li>public-Federal</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>building(s)</li> <li>district</li> <li>site</li> <li>structure</li> <li>object</li> </ul>	00 0	Noncontributing 1 0 0 0 1	sites structures objects
Name of related multiple ( (Enter "N/A" if property is not pa	irt of a multiple property listing.)	Number of co listed in the l	ntributing resources lational Register	
n/a		0	-	
6. Function or Use Historic Functions (Enter Categories from instruction 	ons )	COMMERCE/TR	tions s from instructions) ADE:restaurant	
7. Description				
Architectural Classification (Enter Categories from instruction		Materials (Enter Categories	from instructions)	
_Federal		foundationSTONE		
		walls_BRICK		
		roof_METAL		
		other		

### Narrative Description

(Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

# 8. Statement of Significance

Applicable National Register Criteria (Mark " x " in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for the National Register listing.)

- B Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- C Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.
- D Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

### Criteria Considerations

(Mark "x" in all the boxes that apply.)

### Property is:

- A owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.
- B removed from its original location.
- $\Box$  **C** a birthplace or grave.
- D a cemetery.
- **E** a reconstructed building, object, or structure.
- **F** a commemorative property.
- G less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.

### Narrative Statement of Significance

(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

9. Major Bibliographical References

### Bibliography

( Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more continuation sheets.

# Previous documentation on file (NPS):

- I preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
- previously listed in the National Register
- previously determined eligible by the National Register
- designated a National Historic Landmark
- recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey
- recorded by Historic American Engineering Record # \_\_\_\_\_

Chittenden County, Vermont County and State

	TECTURE
_	
Perio	d of Significance
1822-	-1949
	· · · ·
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Signi	ficant Dates
1822	
<u></u>	
Signi	ificant Person blete If Criterion B is marked above)
( Count	
n/a	
Cultu	ral Affiliation
Cultu	
Cultu	ral Affiliation
Cultu	ral Affiliation
Cultu n/a	ural Affiliation
Cultu n/a Arch	iral Affiliation
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno	itect/Builder
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno e continu	itect/Builder
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno e continu	itect/Builder
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno e continu	ural Affiliation itect/Builder own uation sheets. ry location of additional data: State Historic Preservation Office
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno Prima	uation sheets. ry location of additional data: State Historic Preservation Office Other State agency
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno e continu Prima	uation sheets. ry location of additional data: State Historic Preservation Office Other State agency Federal agency
Cultu n/a Arch Unkno e continu Prima	uation sheets. ry location of additional data: State Historic Preservation Office Other State agency

- Other.
- Name of repository:

University of Vermont

, Roswell, House Property	County and State
agraphical Data	
ge of Property less than one acre	
references Iditional UTM references on a continuation sheet.)	
1 8 6 5 2 2 4 0 4 9 3 0 0 4 0 Zone Easting Northing	3 2000 Easting Northing
Boundary Description e the boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet	See continuation sheet
ary Justification why the boundaries were selected on a continuation she rm Prepared By	eet.)
	Preservation Consultant
	date August 16, 1999
number P.O. Box 5151	telephone (802) 425-2135
WN Burlington	state <u>Vermont</u> zip code <u>05402</u>
onal Documentation	
nal Documentation ne following items with the completed form:	

#### **Continuation Sheets**

#### Maps

A USGS map (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location.

A Sketch map for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources.

### Photographs

Representative black and white photographs of the property.

#### Additional items

( Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)

Property Owner	
( Complete this item at the request of SHPO or FPO.)	
name Mary Russell	
street & number 2. Lida Drive	telephone <u>(802) 879-3116</u>
city or town Essex Junction	_ state Vermont zip code Ω5452

Paper Reduction Act Statement: This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties, and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 470 et seq.).

Estimated Burden Statement: Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18.1 hours per response including time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding thisburden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, P.O. Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Projects (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 1

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

### Summary Paragraph

The Roswell Butler House is located on Route 15 in Essex, Vermont approximately .3 of a mile east of the junction of Route 15 and Route 289. The house is a c. 1822, two-story, 5 x 2 bay, brick, Federal style building with a c. 1850, one and one-half story, brick, gable roof ell. A one-story, Queen Anne style porch originates on the main facade and wraps around to the east facade of the main block of the building. Federal style features of the house include the symmetry of its architectural components, splayed brick window lintels, interior end chimneys, quadrant windows in the gable ends, a modillion cornice and a semi-circular fanlight over the main entry. On the interior the house has wood floors, plaster walls, Federal style door and window surrounds, and historic four panel wood doors that have an assortment of nineteenth and early twentieth century porcelain, ceramic and glass doorknobs. Exposed timber framing in the attic is held together with wood pegs and there is a historic brick cistern and well in the basement. The house was formerly a private residence that has been converted into a coffee shop and bakery. A c. 1950 one-story, two-bay, wood frame garage is a non-contributing building on the property. The Roswell Butler House possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association.

### Statement of Description

The Roswell Butler House is located on Route 15 in Essex, Vermont approximately .3 of a mile east of the junction of Route 15 and Route 289. The house is oriented north and is set back approximately 27 feet from the road. Directly across Route 15 is an open field and wood frame house. To the south and west of the house is the recently constructed Essex Town Center commercial complex that includes retail, residential and office space. The parking lot for this complex is located approximately 35 feet from the rear façade of the house. East of the Butler House is a small yard and row of hardwood trees that act as a border to the neighboring property.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 2

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

The Butler House is a c. 1822, two-story, 5 x 2 bay, common bond brick, Federal style house with a one and one-half story, c. 1850 gable roof ell that projects from the right side of the rear facade of the main block. The house has a cut stone foundation and a side-gable standing seam metal roof with two interior end chimneys. The chimney toward the west end of the house is brick and the one toward the east end is concrete block. Federal style features of the house include the symmetry of its architectural components, splayed brick window lintels, a modillion cornice with cornice returns, quadrant windows in the gable end, and a fanlight over the primary entry.

The main façade of the house is symmetrically divided into five bays with a center entry. All windows are one-over-one, double-hung, wood sash and those on the first story, left of the entry have two-over-two, wood sash, storm windows. The wood entry door has six panels and a decorative cast metal Victorian doorknob. There is a semi-circular fanlight over the door. A one-story, Queen Anne porch with turned posts, sawn brackets, square balusters, latticework skirt, and a hipped, standing seam metal roof originates to the right of the entry and wraps around to the east façade of the main block.

The east and west façades mirror each other with two, one-over-one windows on the first and second stories and two quadrant windows in the gable ends. One of the quadrant windows in each gable has been replaced with a louvered vent.

The rear façade has one, one-over-one window on the first story and one, oneover-one window in the center of the second story. The ell is found on the right side of this façade and its standing seam metal gable roof partially obscures the lower light of the second story window. Unlike the other facades, the foundation of the rear façade is uncut stone.

The one and one-half story brick ell projects to the east approximately ten feet beyond the east façade of the main block so that the north façade of the ell forms a right angle with the east façade of the main block. The ell lacks the modillions

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 3

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

and cornice returns found in the main block. Its bricks are slightly larger and its masonry joints are wider than those in the main block. A poured concrete and concrete block foundation has recently been added under the east and south facades of the ell.

The north façade of the ell has a historic four panel wood door with modern hardware that accesses the Queen Anne porch. There is a splayed brick lintel over the door and a one-over-one window to its left. The gable of this façade contains a six-over-six, double-hung, wood sash window.

The east façade of the ell contains two, one-over-one windows. On the west façade of the ell are two, six-over-six windows and two gable roof dormers with six-over-six windows. The foundation of the west façade is uncut stone.

The south façade of the ell has two, nine-over-six windows in the gable. They are the only windows in the entire house that lack splayed brick lintels. There is a modern one pane, two panel fiberglass door in the center of the first story of this facade. A concrete landing has recently been installed outside the door.

There are nine rooms on the interior of the building – four on the first floor and five on the second floor. Opposite the main façade entry door is the stairway leading to the second floor. To the right and left are doorways leading to the two main rooms on the first floor of the main block.

The room on the right has clear finished floorboards varying from 4" to 14" in width, a wallboard ceiling, 7" baseboards and 4 ½" wide Federal style door and window surrounds. The exterior walls of this room are plaster and the interior walls are wallboard. In the southwest corner of this room is a historic four panel wood door with modern hardware that accesses a bathroom, which contains modern fixtures and a ceramic tile floor.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 4

# Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

The room on the left has a similar ceiling, flooring, baseboards, and door and window surrounds. All the walls in this room are plaster. The east wall of the room contains a brick fireplace and a historic wood mantel with flat, fluted columns<sup>1</sup>. In the southwest corner of this room is a modern door that leads to the kitchen. The kitchen was recently installed and has a ceramic tile floor, wallboard ceiling and walls, and modern fixtures. The south wall of the room has two doorways leading to a room that comprises the first floor interior space of the ell.

Half of the first floor of the ell is divided into a service area with modern cabinets and serving counter and the other half is a seating area. The flooring of the seating area is the previously described clear finish floorboards. The flooring of the service area is ceramic tile. This room has a wallboard ceiling and walls. In the southeast corner of the seating area is a historic four panel wood door leading to a stairway that accesses the second floor of the ell. The door has a historic ceramic doorknob. The interior doors of the house are historic four panel wood doors. Door hardware is an assortment of nineteenth and early twentieth century porcelain, ceramic and glass doorknobs. On the first floor most interior doors have been removed and stored on site. On the second floor the doors remain in place.

The stairway opposite the main façade entry door accesses the second floor of the main block. There is a 8'2" x 4' balustrade at the top of the stairs that has a curved handrail, square balusters and a square newel-post. The handrail and balusters of the balustrade resemble those of the Queen Anne porch. On the opposite side of the wall at the top of the stairway is a bathroom with ceramic tiles and modern fixtures. A doorway in the east wall of the bathroom accesses the attic.

The stairway and a narrow north-south hallway evenly divides the second floor of the main block. There are two rooms on each side of the hallway. These rooms

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This fireplace has the concrete block chimney. The brick chimney at the west end of the main block terminates in the attic.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 5

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

have predominantly plaster walls and ceilings and contain the same baseboards and door and window surrounds as described on the first floor. The wood floors are also the same as those on the first floor with the exception that they are either painted or stained on the second floor.

A doorway in the south wall of the room in the southeast corner of the main block accesses the second floor of the ell. The second floor of the ell has wood flooring and a wallboard ceiling and walls. It lacks the baseboards and Federal style door and window surrounds found in the main block.

Unlike the rooms on the first floor that have modern baseboard heaters, the rooms on the second floor contain early twentieth century hot water radiators.

The Butler House has an unfinished basement and attic. The exposed timber framing in the attic offers a glimpse at early methods of building construction with wood pegs securing the rafters to the ridgepole. The basement floor is part poured concrete and part dirt. There is an 11' x 7'9" brick cistern and a 4' diameter brick well in the basement under the ell.

A c. 1950 one-story, two-bay, wood frame garage with a concrete floor and sidegable asphalt roof is located within a few feet of the southeast corner of the ell and is a non-contributing structure. The west end of this garage has recently been converted into a seasonal ice cream stand.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 1

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

### Summary Paragraph

The Roswell Butler House is significant under criterion C as a good example of the Federal style. Architectural features of this style employed in the c. 1822 house include its side-gable symmetrical massing, center entry crowned with a semi-circular fanlight, splayed brick lintels and modillion cornice. Influenced by Asher Benjamin's carpenter handbooks, *The Country Builder's Assistant* and *The American Builder's Companion*, the Federal style was widely used throughout Vermont from the late 1700s to the 1830s. Similar to many Federal style buildings in Vermont, which were built predominantly in early commercial centers or along important trade routes, the Butler House was constructed at the junction of two roads in Essex, Vermont.

### Statement of Significance

In March 1822, Roswell Butler purchased eighty-one and one-half acres of land in Lot number 107 in Essex, Vermont at auction. He and his brother, William A. Butler, built a wood frame house, brick house, and store on this land by the intersection of what is now Route 15 and Old Stage Road. This intersection took its name from these men and was subsequently referred to as Butler's Corners.

Essex, Vermont was chartered June 7, 1763 but was not permanently settled until the spring of 1783. From this date to 1822, the activities of the town centered around Page's Corners, located 1.8 miles from Butler's Corners at the intersection of Old Stage Road and Brigham Hill Road. This was the location of the first store, post office, taverns, and town meetings in Essex. By 1830, the town had become permanently established around the Essex Town Common, located 1.3 miles from Butler's Corners at the intersection of Route 15 and Route 128, with the construction of a meeting house, school, and churches. In the interim, between 1822 and 1830, many of the town's activities focused around Butler's Corners.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 2

# Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

As a thoroughfare, the importance of the intersection at Butler's Corners was recognized as early as 1800 when a signpost and pair of stocks was located there. Public notices and warrants were posted on the signpost and those offending the law (most frequently through public intoxication and gambling) were subject to the stocks. In his 1883 *Essex Centennial*, L.C. Butler describes the punishment inflicted by the stocks, "the head and feet were made fast between planks around the neck and ankles, and the criminal was subjected not only to the irksome and humiliating confinement in the open air, exposed to sunshine and rain, light and darkness, but also to the gaze and jeers and comments of the passers by." Following the arrival of the Butlers, commercial activity at Butler's Corners included their store, a blacksmith shop, a law office, and a tavern.<sup>1</sup>

The *Essex Centennial* indicates that Roswell and William Butler were "largely engaged in the lumbering and mercantile business" and Roswell is characterized as a "wide-awake businessman... honored with important positions in town affairs." In her *Vermont Historical Gazetteer*, Abby Hemenway notes that Roswell Butler was involved in many diverse business interests.<sup>2</sup> He is listed as one of the "principal dealers" who shipped lumber to Quebec and, following the opening of the Champlain Canal, is listed as one of eight men who carried on the lumber trade with New York and towns on the Hudson River. In October 1826, the Vermont Legislature granted Roswell Butler and a group of five other men a charter to operate a steamboat company on Lake Champlain, which was named the Champlain Transportation Company. Roswell served on a committee to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The blacksmith shop was owned by George Whitney, the law office by David Webster, and the tavern by David Tyler. Bent, in his *History of the Town of Essex*, credits Webster as one of the first lawyers in town and states that Whitney was the finest blacksmith in Essex. L.C. Butler comments that Whitney was very active in the formation of the Methodist church in Essex and that he later became an "earnest, zealous, and emotional preacher."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This historical record, similar to the others listed in the bibliography, attributes these business ventures to Roswell and does not mention William. This suggests that Roswell played a more active role in the affairs of the brothers.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>8</u> Page <u>3</u>

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

oversee the construction of the steamboat, *Franklin*, which began operation the next year. Hemenway also indicates that in 1825-26, the Essex post office was reestablished at Butler's Corners with Roswell Butler serving as postmaster. In 1826, he was paid \$9.96 for his services. Another of Roswell's business ventures is noted in the *Essex Centennial*, which states that he built a hemp mill in the 1820s in what is now Essex Junction, Vermont.

As a prominent businessman, Roswell Butler built his brick house in the Federal style to reflect his social standing and affluence. Referencing the classical forms of ancient Rome, the Federal style was formal and symmetrical. It included architectural features such as a center entryway crowned by a fanlight, splayed lintels over doors and windows, and molded cornices adorned with either dentils or modillions; all of which are found in the Butler House. In Vermont, this style was popular from the late 1700s through the 1830s and was found primarily in commercial centers or along important transportation routes.

The prolific use of the Federal style at this time was influenced by carpenter handbooks written by Asher Benjamin. Benjamin was born in the early 1770s in Connecticut where he apprenticed in the building trades. His skill and inclination in this field are evident at an early age as seen in his commission to design and build a circular staircase in the Connecticut State House in 1795. As a builder, Benjamin felt that the English handbooks of the period focused too much attention on large country estates, complex vaults, and numerous designs that were useless to rural American homebuilders. With that in mind, he published *The Country Builder's Assistant* in 1797 and *The American Builder's Companion* in 1806 in the hopes of producing classically inspired plans that could be employed by self-trained builders. The influence of these handbooks, especially of the cornice (plates 12 and 13), door and fanlight (plate 16) designs in *The American Builder's Companion*, is evident in the architectural features of the Butler House.

NPS Form 10-900-a (8-86)

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 4

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

While the Federal style may have been a natural choice for a prominent businessman to employ in his home in the early 1820s, Roswell Butler's decision to use brick as his building material involves some speculation. As an individual involved in the lumber business. it would stand to reason that he would have used wood. Perhaps he felt the use of brick, similar to his choice of an architectural style, would serve to appropriately reflect his affluence. In his thesis, Architecture and Society of the Urban Frontier: Windsor, Vermont 1798-1820, William Hosley indicates that brick was used infrequently before 1800 yet, by 1815, a majority of the high-style houses in inland New England were constructed of this material. Herbert Wheaton Congdon, in his Old Vermont Houses, speculates that "perhaps a mild ambition for a house fitting its owner's social position sometimes entered into the matter" however, he argues that the easy maintenance and permanence of brick were the decisive factors that dictated its use. Butler's choice may also have been influenced by the geology of Essex, which, compared with other locations in Vermont, was ideal for brick making. Colonel Samuel Page built a brick house at Page's Corners in 1822 and was supplied by a brickyard two miles to the north on the stage road. Bent, in his History of the Town of Essex, indicates that many early farms in Essex show traces of small brickyards. The Drury Brick Company operated in Essex Junction from the mid-nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century and Child's Gazetteer of 1882-83 describes the brook that ran through this brickyard as having, "one side of excellent clay, while on the other side the sand for its manufacture into brick is found in abundance." Any one or a combination of these factors could have influenced the use of brick in the Butler House.

Later in his life, Roswell Butler experienced economic setbacks that would have to be settled upon his death<sup>3</sup>. The cause of his financial difficulties is not known although the *Essex Centennial* indicates that his entire hemp mill was lost in "the terrible freshet of 1830." Book 6, Page 390 of the Town of Essex Land Records

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> An archaeology report titled, *Phase 1A Archaeological Study for Essex Town Center at Butler's Corners and Wetland Mitigation Area* states that Roswell and William A. Butler are buried in the Essex Center cemetery. Roswell died in 1833 at age 48, and William died in 1832 at age 36.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 5

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

states that, "the personal estate of the said deceased [Roswell] is not sufficient to pay his just debts (and legacies) by the sum of fifty thousand dollars." The Probate Court for the District of Chittenden authorized the sale of Roswell's real estate at public auction "to pay his just debts." Auction advertisements submitted by George Whitney, administrator of the estate of Roswell Butler, to the Burlington Free Press in the summer of 1834 indicate that the estate included lands in Essex, Colchester, Jericho, and Burlington, Vermont. These advertisements invite "capitalists... to notice as probably there never has been an opportunity offered for so favorable an investment of capital." On August 27, 1834 sale of the "home farm", which included, "seventy-five acres of Lot No. 107 with the buildings thereon to wit; brick house, white house, red houses, shops, and offices together with all the barns and sheds subject to a mortgage to David Tyler" was made to Thaddeus Fletcher. Fletcher sold the property a year later to Jacob Maeck, and, at some point in the late 1830s, Jedediah Tuttle acquired the Butler House and eighteen acres of land. In 1851, Jedediah Tuttle's estate is described in Book 10, Page 77 of the Town of Essex Land Records and includes, "the homestead containing about 18 acres of land together with the dwelling house and shed attached, store and shed adjoining, also one small house and barn now occupied by tenants." At this time the homestead "excepting the large barn" was appraised at \$1,683 and became the property of Jedediah's widow, Eliza Tuttle<sup>4</sup>.

From 1851 to the present, there is a continuously recorded deed history of the Butler House. In December 1862, Josiah Tuttle, administrator of Eliza Tuttle's estate, sold the house and land to John Thompson for \$2,500. Daniel Thompson, son of John, sold the property to Annis, Caroline, and Harriet Thompson in May, 1883. These women sold the property, along with four cows, "one single old lumber wagon" and a plow to Chastina Allen ten years later. In total, the house was transferred to new owners nineteen times from 1851 to the present with its

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> An 1857 Map of Chittenden County, Vermont by H.F. Walling confirms this information with the name, "Mrs. E Tuttle" found at Butler's Corners. Eliza Tuttle's immediate neighbors at the time included, "C E Day, H Parker, J Blood, M Wool, and H Day."

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 8 Page 6

# Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

associated land remaining at 18 acres until the mid-1960s when it became a two acre lot.<sup>5</sup> Its current lot is less than one acre.

The subsequent owners of the Butler House during its period of significance were predominantly merchants or farmers. In the 1840 population census, Jedediah is listed as head of a household that included two other males and four females. The census indicates that only one person in the family was employed (presumably Jedediah) and the means of their employment was agriculture. However, the 1850 census lists Jedediah's occupation as merchant and it includes the following names and ages of individuals in the family: Jedediah, 47; Eliza, 46; Almira, 16; Albert, 13; Horace, 8; Josiah, 40 (also a merchant); and Sophronia Ayers, 30. By 1860, the household consisted of only four individuals -Eliza, Horace, Josiah and a female servant named Delice Batey. This census states that the value of Eliza's real estate was \$3,500 and her personal estate was valued at \$10,000. In W.S. Rann's 1886, History of Chittenden County, Vermont, Josiah Tuttle, Jedediah's brother, is listed as a retired farmer and merchant who was involved in the manufacture of woolen goods. It also states that Josiah represented Essex in the State Legislature in 1849 and the Senate in 1858-59. Josiah is also credited with donating a marble tablet placed in the Essex Town Hall that honored the town's residents who died during the Civil War<sup>6</sup>.

Following the Tuttles ownership, the Butler House was home to the Thompsons. The 1870 population census lists John Thompson, age 75, as a farmer and head of the household. Living with John at this time were his sons; James, 53, a bookkeeper, and Daniel, 50, a dentist, and his daughters; Annis, 52, Caroline, 44, and Harriet, 37, all whom kept house. The 1880 population census reveals

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> One notable deed from 1918 stated that all personal property was included in the sale of the house except, "carpenters tools, ten cords stove wood, hand seeder, black cherry lumber, vegetables and fruit."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The cost of the tablet was \$210.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>8</u> Page <u>7</u>

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

additional information about the family. It indicates that John Thompson is a widower, Daniel is divorced, and all the daughters are single. James is no longer listed and there is a notation that Harriet was disabled with a spinal condition. Agricultural census records from the same period indicate that John Thompson had an 18 acre farm that produced corn, oats, Irish potatoes, and apples. The 1880 census lists his livestock as one horse, six cows, one pig, and 27 poultry. Farm production at this time included 1000 pounds of butter and 200 dozen eggs. By 1900, the Butler House had been sold to Chastina Allen, however, the population census for this year lists Chastina's aunt, Rhoda Shanley, as head of the household. The census states that Shanley is a 53-year-old, widowed farmer and Allen is 17 years old and attends school. Also living in the household at this time was Rhoda Shanley's mother, Catherine, 79, whose parents emigrated from Ireland. In July 1901, Rhoda Shanley, as executrix of Chastina Allen's estate, sold the Butler House to Henry Atherton for \$1,700.

The Butler House is one of the few surviving and best preserved examples of brick, Federal style architecture in the Essex, Vermont area. Another example that was previously mentioned is the 1822 Colonel Samuel Page House located at Page's Corners. Similar to the Butler House it is a two-story, five-bay, sidegable, common bond brick house with a center entry fanlight, splayed brick lintels over the windows, and quadrant window openings in the gable, however, unlike the Butler House, it lacks a modillion cornice and its guadrant windows have all been boarded or replaced with vents. Located closer to the Butler House (approximately .1 mile away) on Old Stage Road is a one and one-half story, side-gable, center entry, common bond brick Federal style house, however, it lacks the splayed brick lintels, quadrant windows, and modillion cornice found in the Butler House. A final example of brick, Federal style architecture from the area is Lincoln Hall built c. 1819 approximately 1.9 miles to the west on Route 15 in the village of Essex Junction, Vermont. Original used as a tavern, this building now houses the village offices. It is a two-story, five-bay, side-gable, common bond brick building with a center entry fanlight and paired interior, end chimneys. It contains splayed brick lintels on only one façade and lacks a modillion cornice.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>8</u> Page <u>8</u>

# Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

The Butler House is significant in the interpretation of the use of the Federal style in Vermont. By the mid-nineteenth century the popularity of the Federal style had given way to the Greek Revival style. This transition is evidenced in a brick house found .4 of a mile from the Butler House on Old Stage Road. Constructed only a decade after the Butler House this home employs different architectural and stylistic features. The fanlight, center entry and splayed brick lintels of the Federal style have been replaced with a gable-front side entry with flat wood lintels over the doors and windows. For the next half century, the Greek Revival style was used prolifically throughout Vermont.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>9</u> Page <u>1</u>

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

Agricultural census records for Essex, Vermont for 1860, 1870, 1880 found on microfilm at the Bailey-Howe Library at the University of Vermont.

Beers, F.W. <u>Atlas of Chittenden Co. Vermont</u>. Published by Charles E. Tuttle, Company, 1869.

Benjamin, Asher. <u>The Country Builder's Assistant</u>. [Reprint of 1797 edition] New York: Da Capo Press, 1972.

Benjamin, Asher, and Daniel Raynerd. <u>The American Builder's Companion</u>. [Reprint of 1806 edition] New York: Da Capo Press, 1972.

Bent, Frank R., ed. <u>The History of the Town of Essex</u>. Essex Junction, VT: Essex Publishing Company, Inc., 1963.

Bruhn, Paul, ed. <u>Historic Preservation in Vermont</u>. The Preservation Trust of Vermont, 1982.

Burlington Free Press, May 9, 1834.

\_\_\_\_\_, May 30, 1834.

\_\_\_\_\_, July 4, 1834.

\_\_\_\_\_, August 1, 1834.

Butler, L.C. <u>Essex Centennial: The One Hundredth Anniversary of the Settlement</u> of <u>Essex</u>, <u>Vermont</u>. Montpelier, VT: Argus and Patriot Book and Job Printing House, 1883.

Carlisle, Lilian Baker, ed. Look Around Essex and Williston, Vermont. Burlington, VT: George Little Press, Inc., 1973.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 9 Page 2

## Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

Child, Hamilton. <u>Gazetteer & Business Directory of Chittenden County, Vermont</u> for 1882-1883. Syracuse, NY: Journal Office, 1882.

Congdon, Herbert Wheaton. <u>Old Vermont Houses</u>. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1946.

Consulting Archaeology Program, University of Vermont. <u>Phase 1A</u> <u>Archaeological Study for Essex Town Center at Butler's Corners and Wetland</u> <u>Mitigation Area Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont</u>. (Report No. 181) August, 1997. (Found at the Vermont Division for Historic Preservation)

Gundel, Mary, and Mary Reilly, ed. <u>Know Essex</u>. Essex Junction, VT: Essex Publishing Company, 1975.

Hemenway, Abby Maria, ed. <u>Vermont Historical Gazetteer: A Magazine</u> <u>Embracing a History of Each Town, Civil, Ecclesiastical, Biographical and</u> <u>Military</u>. Volume 1. Published by Miss A. M. Hemenway, 1867.

Hosley, William Newell, Jr. "Architecture and Society of the Urban Frontier: Windsor, Vermont, 1798-1820." Thesis found in the Special Collections Department of the Bailey-Howe Library at the University of Vermont, 1981.

Johnson, Curtis B., ed. <u>The Historic Architecture of Vermont: Guide to Vermont</u> <u>Architecture</u>. Vermont Division for Historic Preservation, 1992.

Population census records for Essex, Vermont for 1850, 1860, 1870, 1880, 1900 found on microfilm at the Bailey-Howe Library at the University of Vermont.

Quinan, Jack. "Asher Benjamin and American Architecture." <u>Journal of the</u> <u>Society of Architectural Historians</u> 38, no. 3 (1979): 244-256.

Rann, W. S., ed. <u>History of Chittenden County Vermont</u>. Syracuse, NY: D. Mason and Company, Publishers, 1886.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 9 Page 3

### Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

Town of Essex, Vermont Land Records found in Town Clerk's Office Essex, VT:

Book 3, Page 469. Book 5, Page 475. Book 6, Page 390. Book 6, Page 410. Book 6, Page 491. Book 8, Pages 2-4. Book 8, Page 375. Book 10, Page 77. Book 12, Page 418. Book 20, Page 205-207. Book 20, Page 244. Book 22, Page 447. Book 28, Page 199. Book 31, Page 261. Book 33, Page 188. Book 34, Page 594. Book 35, Page 287. Book 53, Page 287. Book 65, Page 105. Book 65, Page 105. Book 70, Page 314. Book 71, Page 298. Book 81, Page 521. Book 121, Page 149. Book 169, Page 435. Book 251, Page 344. Book 401, Page 36.

Walling, H.F. <u>Map of Chittenden County, Vermont</u>. Baker, Tilden Co., Publishers, 1857.

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number <u>10</u> Page <u>1</u>

# Butler, Roswell, House Essex, Chittenden County, Vermont

Verbal Boundary Description

The boundary conforms with the property's current lot lines as delineated by the Town of Essex, Vermont tax lot number 2-091-003-000.

Verbal Boundary Justification

The land within this boundary visually and historically conveys the significance of the property.